

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

love of Him who took the children in His arms, and to the tender care of the Good Shepherd, who carried the lambs in His bosom, and who said: "Suffer the little children to come unto Me, and forbid them not"; and, "Him that cometh unto Me I will in no wise cast out." For, howsoever assiduous we pastors of souls may be, our discrimination at best lacks finality; whereas "God seeth not as man seeth, for man looketh on the outward appearance, but God looketh on the heart"; and our Master has declared: "That many shall come from the east and from the west, and from the north and from the south, and shall sit down in the kingdom of God," and "there are first that shall be last, and last that shall be first."



A New Hymnal.¹

By E. H. BLAKENEY, M.A.

THE failure of the last (1904) edition of "Hymns Ancient and Modern" rendered it certain that a new hymn-book would, sooner or later, be issued, which should occupy the place that the compilers of the older collection had hoped for their own book. As a matter of fact, the present volume must have been in preparation for some years, for it is not possible that a work so thorough, so careful, and so full, should be the result of a hasty patching together.

Externally, "The English Hymnal" is very attractive—*simplex munditiis* would be no inadequate description. A comparison, too, between it and any other collection, on the ground of adequate editing, will at once decide criticism in its favour. Indeed, from the "mechanical" point of view, it would be difficult to improve upon the design of the present volume. The preface, occupying nearly thirty pages, lays down, from the outset, the principles upon which the compilers have worked; the table of contents is full enough for all practical purposes; the indices and "tables" at the end are pretty well exhaustive. Thus, for example, we have (1) a table of office hymns for Saints' days; (2) a list of hymns arranged for Sundays and Holy-days; (3) a list of simple hymns, suitable for Mission services; (4) a *metrical* index of tunes followed by an *alphabetical* index of the same; (5) index of composers; (6) index of authors; (7) an index of original first lines of translated hymns—Greek, Latin, Syriac, German, Welsh, Irish, Italian, Danish, Swahili; (8) a general index of first lines.

¹ "The English Hymnal": with Tunes. Oxford: Henry Frowde, 1906. Pp. xxviii, 968. Price 3s. net.

On opening the volume, it will be found that each hymn has its source given—author's or translator's name, with date where possible—with the name of the tune, the name of the composer, and the necessary metrical marks assigned. All this is a great advantage.

The book is divided into twelve parts, thus :

- | | |
|---|--|
| (i.) The Christian Year. | (vii.) Church and People. |
| (ii.) Saints' Days and other Holy-days. | (viii.) Mission Services. |
| (iii.) Times and Seasons. | (ix.) At Catechism. |
| (iv.) Sacraments and other Rites. | (x.) Processional. |
| (v.) General Hymns. | (xi.) Litanies, etc. |
| (vi.) Special Occasions. | (xii.) Introits, Grails, Antiphons, etc. |

There are 656 hymns proper (excluding introits, etc.); of these 173 are assigned to Part I., 60 to Part IV., while 158 belong to Part V.

The Editorial Committee appear to have been seven in number (one, the Rev. W. H. H. Jervois, has died since the book went to press), viz., W. J. Birkbeck, Percy Dearmer, A. Hanbury-Tracy, T. A. Lacey, D. C. Lathbury, Athelstan Riley, and W. H. H. Jervois. These names are sufficient to make one pause. They all belong to distinctly party men, though we are told (p. iii of the Preface) that the book is "not a party book." We shall see, however. Hymn 208 ("The Purification") opens thus :

" All prophets hail thee, from of old announcing,
By the inbreathed Spirit of the Father,
God's Mother, bringing prophecies to fulness,
Mary the Maiden."

A little further on, we come across the following (Mr. Athelstan Riley's rendering of a ninth-century Annunciation hymn) :

" Hail, O Star that pointest
Toward the port of heaven,
Thou to whom as maiden
God for Son was given."

And Mary's intercessions are then implored in vers. 3-6. Hymns 215 and 218 are similarly full of extravagant prayers to Mary. No. 350 (translated by Dr. Littledale) gives us the following :

" Harken to the gentle pleading
Of thy Mother, gracious Lord."

and again (ver. 6) :

" When, O kind and radiant Jesu,
Kneels the Queen thy throne before,
Let the court of Saints attending
Mercy for the dead implore."

Not much better is Keble's hymn beginning :

" Ave Maria! blessed Maid!
Lily of Eden's fragrant shade!"

with its

" Ave Maria! thou whose name
All but adoring love may claim."

Needless to say the Sacramental hymns inculcate what is curiously termed nowadays as the "full Catholic doctrine" of the Real Presence, and prayers for the dead are everywhere encouraged. And yet we are told this is "no

party book!" Will any loyal Evangelical clergyman venture to introduce such a book into his parish? Surely not.

I do not mean to assert that the new Hymnal is not, in many directions, a most valuable work—*apart*, that is, *from such doctrinal blemishes*. But then, consider what this implies. It implies that, for Evangelicals, the book can be employed, safely, only as a sort of private collection, at once a manual of music and devotion; and that, for congregational purposes, we cannot honestly employ it.

The rest of my remarks, then, will deal with the book in its *non-congregational* aspect.

The *principles* on which the editors have made their selection are sound enough, even though we cannot regard their practice as always satisfactory. Thus, hymns are printed as their authors originally wrote them; ample scope is given for the inclusion of hymns of an "occasional" order; the hymns of long-passed ages have been translated, so as to make the volume really representative of the centuries; and complete provision has been made for the liturgical needs of Church people.

At the same time I am of opinion that far too many *new* hymns have been introduced, both original and translated. Now, it requires time and experience to decide whether a hymn is really suitable, or not, for Church use, and I am disposed to think that no hymn should be admitted into a collection like the present—which is intended to make a bid for universal use—unless it has stood the test of at least ten years. Hymns that have stood such a test in some other collection may fairly hope to last; but new hymns are to be avoided; there is too much of the problematical about them.

One feels (as one turns over the pages of the book), as one has always felt, how very rare it is for a translated hymn to have anything like "the sprightly runnings" of a hymn written, not to order, but as the result of inner convictions. Even Calverley's work halts (*cf.* No. 225). Of course there are exceptions; J. M. Neale, for example, had the rare gift of writing felicitous and easy renderings, as a glance at No. 276 will show. None of the newer translators in the present book have his grace or ease, and at times—indeed, oftentimes—they fail deplorably.

With the original hymns, too, one may *generally* remark a lack of *inevitableness* about the diction. It would hardly be too much to say that there are scarcely fifty hymns in the language that are, besides being congregationally suitable and doctrinally sound, really true poems. Of these fifty I believe that Dr. Watts's "O God our help" stands first, and next to it (perhaps) C. Wesley's "Come, O Thou Traveller unknown" (which unfortunately appears in a truncated version in the present book). But some of Bonar's hymns, one or two of Ken's and Keble's, and perhaps one of Faber's, run these close. Among quite modern hymns (but over fifteen years old) Canon Julian's "Father of all, to Thee" holds a high, a very high, place; and of hymns hitherto unknown we may speak with fair confidence of Mr. G. K. Chesterton's "O God of earth and altar" (No. 562).

Of alterations and additions to hymns, as they generally appear in collections, I cannot now speak, but the reader may look up Nos. 245, 267, 279, 353.

Of the musical portion of the book one may, for the most part, speak with unstinted praise. To rescue from old German chorale books, from really popular and national sources, from old plain-song music, tunes that were genuinely ecclesiastical and simple, was a good work; and it has been well done in this volume. "Tune" the melodies are not, but it is time for the Sankey and Moody melodies, and the opera catches, to be banished from Church worship. At the same time, we have no sympathy with the manifest tendency of the musical editor (R. Vaughan Williams) to put fresh—not necessarily new—tunes to words to which tunes have become wedded. There are many flagrant instances¹ of this sort of folly in "The English Hymnal," and it deserves entire reprobation.

I notice with dismay that the musical editor (or editors—for Mr. Birbeck has been very assiduous in giving help with the plain-song melodies—of which the book is full) appears to be tolerably ignorant of, or indifferent to, that princely collection of fine hymn tunes, Dr. Samuel Sebastian Wesley's "European Psalmist." Wesley was one of the greatest Church composers England has ever had; and why he is represented by only five tunes in this collection is amazing. Surely his noble setting of Charles Wesley's "Come, O Thou Traveller" is to be preferred to Robert King's melody, which appears here.

A good plan—which appears to be partly followed in this book—is to set contemporary tunes to hymns; thus, seventeenth-century words should (as far as possible) have a seventeenth-century melody attached.

To sum up: the book is, in many directions, the best collection of hymns (and tunes) we have had; it is a great deal more scholarly than any other collection I know, and bears traces of extreme care. *But*, owing to its "extreme" tendencies, I see no likelihood of its becoming universally adopted; and, indeed, candour compels me to say I should be very sorry if this happened.



Literary Notes.

A NEW series of volumes, which is likely to meet with a hearty welcome is to deal with the history of the Dark Ages. Four volumes are likely to be out soon dealing with the history of culture and civilization, practically from the age of Diocletian to that of Charlemagne. The Rev. A. J. Carlyle is the editor of this series, and he has much experience of this particular period. Mr. H. Stuart Jones is the author of the first volume, which is devoted to "The Last Centuries of the Ancient Empire." The other three volumes in this first group are "The Barbarians and the Carolingian Empire," by Mr. C. J. B. Gaskoin; "The Civilization of Ireland," by Mr. E. C. Quiggin; and "The Empire from Charles the Great to the Death

¹ There seems a conspiracy to get rid of some of the best of our modern tunes—*e.g.*, those by Stainer, Sullivan, Barnby; even Monk and Dykes get discounted here.