

# Theology on the Web.org.uk

*Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible*

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

---

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

[https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles\\_churchman\\_os.php](https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php)

# Book Reviews

## **JAMES BARR AND THE BIBLE : Critique of a New Liberalism** PAUL RONALD WELLS

*Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, USA 1980*

406pp. US \$12.00

USA ISBN 0 87552 546 6

## **UNDER GOD'S WORD** JIM PACKER

*Cornerstone, USA 1980*

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1980 159pp. £1.50*

ISBN 0 551 00889 X

Two very different types of literature are now emerging on the subject of the authority of the Bible. A few writers are managing to say something fresh about the subject of biblical authority. More important, they recognize the inadequacy of so many of the tired and well-worn arguments that are repeatedly put forward from various sides in the debate. But creative and constructive work has been threatened by the recent emergence of a second trend, namely the introduction and deliberate feeding of a politics of confrontation. Harold Lindsell has done much to bring about this unhappy confrontation situation, trying to force evangelicals back into the old entrenched positions. No less unhappy is the emergence, on this side of the Atlantic, of an increasingly polemical and aggressive note in the writings of James Barr, which once again causes reaction, suspicion and polarization. It is therefore of more than passing interest to enquire what P. R. Wells makes of this path of development in Barr's writings, and to ask how Jim Packer responds to the so-called inerrancy debate initiated, or at least fuelled, by Lindsell.

Wells makes a number of important points. First, he enquires about the adequacy of the Christological model as a way of understanding the interrelation between the divine and the human in the Scriptures. He agrees with Barr that this model is inadequate: 'Hypostasis is absent in the case of the Bible and the parallel with Christ cannot be used to explain the mode of union of the elements of the Bible' (pp.340-1). Second, Barr's writings are viewed as a development which moves from an emphasis in the earlier writings on the humanness of the Bible towards a stronger protest in more recent writings against the concept of biblical authority. Barr's overarching concern is that 'only where there is freedom from pre-conceived ideas about what the text *must* mean in the realm of descriptive study can scripture speak *freely*' (p.4). Thus Wells contends that Barr's work on the semantics of biblical language was motivated by something more than a concern about linguistic methods alone. As Barr's later writings emerge, we see increasingly 'an inveterate dislike for the notion of authority' (p.151). A third and more constructive question concerns the relation between the human and the divine as the broader context of debate about the Bible. Wells accuses Barr of a dualism in this respect, in which the Bible is relegated effectively to the human side of the divide.

It is not clear whether Wells is right or wrong in trying to diagnose a theological 'motivation' behind Barr's work on semantics. It may well be that Barr's wholly correct attention to linguistic evidence brought home to him more clearly the humanness of the biblical writings. But which is cause and which is effect? Of much more positive help is the author's own attempt to place the issues in the broader context of God's relation to the world. Several writers in North America are at present trying to wrestle with this problem,

and we may hope that Wells will carry his own initial enquiries much further.

Jim Packer is at his strongest when he makes a number of important *pastoral* observations in three of the four essays entitled *Under God's Word*. He warns us that vested interests may be involved in the current debate; he stresses that humility is a requirement for learning; and that questions about authority remain abstract and sterile if we fail to use and interpret the Bible appropriately and obediently. He warns us, too, that we must not fall victim to our own religious or cultural prejudices, and urges (again rightly) that one good way to overcome this danger is to attend to the great historical classics of theology. The author also takes up material collected in 1961 by R. J. Coates, which serves to reinforce some of these practical points: 'A loveless handling of the Bible is but a means of discord' (p.103). There are also useful reflections, especially in the fourth and final essay, about the relation between the Bible and the church in historical theology.

What worries me is Jim Packer's chapter on the 'inerrancy' debate, and especially his reviews of the two books by Lindsell and by Rogers. Lindsell's book, *The Bible in the Balance*, singles out specific fellow-evangelicals for attack. If their publications do not provide clear enough evidence of alleged departures from orthodoxy, Lindsell resorts to consulting their students' lecture/notes. Much is made of probable 'motivations' (wretched word) behind outlooks and the acceptance of particular teaching appointments. The Board of Fuller comes under fire for having certain teachers on its staff. The epistle of James (especially 4:11) does not use congratulatory language for this kind of thing. I could hardly believe my eyes, therefore, when I read Jim Packer's comment, 'Thank you, Harold Lindsell, for having the guts to do what you have done' (p.146). Worse, having swallowed the camel of Lindsell, Jim Packer strains out the gnat of Rogers and McKim. Whatever one may think about the details of their historical work, their central point is surely right: we need better models and paradigms than the old ones.

What we need now is more silence, more listening, more learning, more charity, more trust, and above all more *sophistication* in the debate. We need to ask deeper and more searching questions about God, about truth, and language, and about the use of controlling models in theology. Negatively, we must not allow the debate to fall back into the sterile politics of confrontation. Those who trouble to read the whole of Jim Packer's book will find a large-mindedness and sensitivity to the problems which shows that he too is aware of the dangers of confrontation. But there are other parts of this book which will suggest something very different, at least to the more casual reader, and this is to be regretted.

University of Sheffield

ANTHONY THISELTON

**NEW LIGHT ON EXODUS : The Narrative Explained  
Against its Geographical, Historical and Social Background**  
WILLIAM TODD

*The Furnival Press 1980 212pp. £4.50*

It is sad to have to say it, especially of a posthumously published work, but reading this book reminded me of Amos' words about the day of the Lord—'darkness and not light, and gloom with no brightness in it'. The publisher presents it as a 'significant and original contribution' (p.7), but such a description is misplaced.

To begin with, about one third of the book consists of passages drawn from the AV text of Exodus (and Numbers), while a good proportion of the rest

offers little more than rather banal, paraphrastic comment thereon. Then there are many old suggestions apparently presented as though they were new, though it is difficult to be sure, since secondary documentation is lacking throughout. That the event at the sea, for instance, belongs to Lake Sirbonis has often been advocated (most notably by O. Eissfeldt). A view of this kind deserves full consideration, and can be given firmer foundations than Todd provides. On the other hand, the really new ideas only furnish a crop of dubious linguistic and historical suggestions of the most superficially ingenious kind.

Basic to the whole approach is a naively 'eyewitness' view of the text. Yet we are told that the witnesses behind the text frequently misunderstood the real mechanics of what was happening, and this results throughout in a rationalizing of the narratives. Is historicity worth saving at such a price?

Todd argues that the text of Exodus 'needs editing' (p.32), and makes some suggestions about displacements in the material (see, for example, pp.73f. with 181ff.; 126; 151ff.). How such dislocations came about, we are never told. More seriously still, Todd's analysis is never deep enough or serious enough to see the real dimensions of the critical issues raised by the diversity and combination of the materials in Exodus. A tradition-historical approach is far more fruitful in opening up in the historical depth of the book; and I do not think it is simply accidental that Todd's work lacks theological penetration too. The discussion of the plagues, for example, is fair neither to the detail nor to the spirit of the stories. Again, none would deny the importance of the study of historical geography for understanding Exodus, but Todd hardly begins to do justice to its complexities. His method is too cavalier, too eager to cut knots. We may contrast, for instance, the careful literary and topographical study by G. I. Davies, *The Way of the Wilderness* (1979).

Clearly, Todd's book was a labour of love, and it reflects something of an evident enthusiasm. It may provide the odd useful insight if used critically. Regrettably, however, I have to say that the work seems to me to be frequently wrong in detail, and generally wrong-headed in principle.

St John's College, Nottingham

EDWARD BALL

## EXODUS The New Century Bible Commentary

J. P. HYATT

first published 1971

Eerdmans, USA 1981

Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1981 351pp. £4.95

USA ISBN 0 8028 1844 7

UK ISBN 0 551 00843 1

In this revised edition, the bibliography is considerably expanded and brought up to date but there seems to have been little change in the text. The commentary is based on the RSV, but includes only a summary of the contents of each chapter and not the Bible text. This means that there is more room for introduction and comment than used to be the case in earlier commentaries in this series. About one seventh of the volume is devoted to introduction, in which literary analysis, transmission of the traditions, and the history of the period are the predominant interests. There is no discussion of the theology of the book, but there are useful excursions on such topics as the name Yahweh and the location of Sinai, and in an appendix the author assesses natural explanations of the plagues.

Key Hebrew words are transliterated but the interest is almost entirely in vocabulary characteristics of the different sources. Despite the stated aim of

the editors of the series to provide a commentary that includes 'reflections on the contemporary relevance of the text', there is very little reference to its application to life. Painstaking scholarly work underlies this commentary, which would make it ideal for the student taking Exodus for a set book in an examination, but the pastor and preacher would not be greatly helped in sermon preparation or in grappling with ethical issues. In this respect the commentary is disappointing.

Trinity College, Bristol

JOYCE BALDWIN

**THE BOOK OF JOB** The New Century Bible Commentary  
H. H. ROWLEY

*first published 1970*

*Eerdmans, USA 1981*

USA ISBN 0 8028 1838 2

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1981 281pp. £4.95* UK ISBN 0 551 00859 8

This is the softback reprint of the 1976 revision of the commentary which first appeared in 1970, a year after Professor Rowley's death. It made a fine conclusion to his writings on the Old Testament, for the book of Job clearly aroused in him a strong and admiring response. As is well known from his earlier essay, 'The Book of Job and Its Meaning', Rowley viewed the book as substantially a unity, whose prose prologue and epilogue are from the same author as the poetic dialogue and are integral to the argument. He defends this position against all comers, displaying his customary breadth of reading and a very firm grasp of the book's overall purpose. At the same time, however, he agrees with the many who, within this, see textual disorder in the final round of speeches between Job and his friends, who also query the function (but not the brilliance) of chapter 28 in its present position, and who consider the speeches of Elihu and the second speech of Yahweh to be secondary and inferior material.

The verse-by-verse comments discuss the many open questions of translation in enough detail to put the reader well in the picture, but not at the expense of the thread of the argument, whose progress is clearly waymarked by frequent paragraph headings and summarizing introductions.

What makes this a commentary of more than purely academic value is Rowley's keen appreciation of the spiritual pilgrimage of Job, whose relationship with God, desperately threatened but finally enriched and deepened, is expounded here not only with clarity but with notable sensitivity and warmth.

Histon, Cambridge

DEREK KIDNER

**ISAIAH 1-39** The New Century Bible Commentary  
R. E. CLEMENTS

*first published by Eerdmans, USA and in UK in 1980* USA ISBN 0 8028 1841 2

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1981 301pp. £4.95* UK ISBN 0 551 00828 8

Everything from Dr Clements' pen rouses its own sense of grateful anticipation, and this commentary on Isaiah 1-39 is no exception. Dr Clements

majors on a historical approach—the national and world background, the identification and dating of original oracles and of redactional work—and it cannot but be considered a pity that theological comment has so largely been driven from the field. In chapter 6, for example, the doctrines of holiness and atonement are very sketchily touched, and the doctrine of divine providence in 10:5-15 not mentioned. But historically, the commentary is rich, and every reader will be rewarded by a most remarkable enhancement of awareness of the setting of the Isaianic literature.

As to the literature, Dr Clements holds to the view of a Josianic redaction—briefly, that around and within an Isaianic nucleus (6:1-8:18) others built up (from Isaianic and other material) a prophetic meditation on the theme of Assyrian power, related to the early days of Josiah (chs 5-32). The catastrophe of 587 BC stimulated study of Isaiah's thought regarding the future of the monarchy and of the city so that gradually the corpus of 1-39 was created.

The reasons given for this view are not fully persuasive. If, for example, we eschew emotive works like 'predictive', we can still ask to what extent a mind like Isaiah's would necessarily engage in 'forward perception'. If he is aware of the seeds of disaster present in Jerusalem, why does it require more Assyrian threat than he experienced for them to be spelled out? Could he not have done it? Or, on another matter, if he could paint the monarchic picture of 9:2-7, as Dr Clements argues, why does 11:1ff. demand a post-exilic redactor? Part of the answer offered to this question is the matter of the thematic placing of the two passages. On the whole, this commentary is strong on thematic observation (cf. on chs 24-27) but sometimes lacks rigour: surely the thematic build-up from chapter 1 through chapter 5 is plain enough? It seems odd, therefore, to make the Josianic redaction begin at 5:1. Surely the thematic integration of chs 36,37 with chs 28-35 is plainly arguable; why then make such heavy weather over chs 34,35 and treat chs 36-39 as a sort of optional extra within the corpus?

But however many questions are asked, an identical number of benefits could be adduced, and we await keenly the publication of the author's work on 'Isaiah and the Deliverance of Jerusalem' alluded to several times in the commentary.

Trinity College, Bristol

J. A. MOTYER

## FROM CHAOS TO COVENANT : Uses of Prophecy in the Book of Jeremiah ROBERT P. CARROLL

SCM Press 1981 344pp. £8.50

ISBN 0 334 02013 1

The publisher's blurb describes this as 'the first major work on Jeremiah in English for over fifty years.' Whether or not this is an extravagant claim, Carroll's book is inescapably a major work. In general terms his aim is to take seriously the fact that all we know of Jeremiah the prophet is mediated to us by the deuteronomistic editors of the book. The implications of this have rarely been confronted as thoroughly and persistently as here, or with the same sociological awareness and sensitivity. What role do the deuteronomists and their theology (Carroll would be inclined to call it ideology) play in the shaping of the tradition? To what extent does the book reflect their interests, preoccupations and search for power? And how accessible is the Jeremiah of history?

Some conservatives will find the book disturbing. Several observations make it clear that Carroll dislikes the 'idolatry' of fundamentalism. He disturbs that consensus which has tended to treat the book as firsthand witness to the character, convictions and career of Jeremiah the man. The famous 'confessions' (soliloquies) are more probably psalm-like commentary on the developing Jeremiah tradition than the literal agonizings of the prophetic soul. The chaos proclaimed by Jeremiah becomes the covenant proclaimed by the deuteronomists. The Jeremiah of history is not entirely inaccessible, but is elusive, and often hidden by Jeremiah the embryo-deuteronomist.

The overall approach is necessary and proper. There is a wealth of serious analysis and exegesis, and it becomes very clear why most scholars suspect long and complex processes in the production of many prophetic books. It is possible to be more positive about deuteronomistic ideology, and to suspect that deuteronomistic interest in Jeremiah was not totally distorting, but many of the romanticized interpretations of the prophet deserve to go, and Carroll does much to help them on their way.

This should not be thought of as merely a work of destructive criticism. As Jeremiah the individual tends to recede, so the living community of faith comes to the fore. The book is a preparatory work on the subject, and the author's forthcoming commentary promises well.

Westminster College, Oxford

PHILIP J. BUDD

## DICTIONARY OF THE NEW TESTAMENT

XAVIER LEON-DUFOUR

translated TERENCE PRENDERGAST

Geoffrey Chapman 1980 458pp. £16.95

ISBN 0 225 66253 1

This is a massive book, in more ways than one. Fifty-two of its 458 pages give a concise and extremely helpful picture of the background to the NT: its historical context, the land, people, cultural heritage, politics and the law, family life, religious movements, etc. These are followed by a further 360 pages of dictionary, listing the important words, names and concepts of the NT. Interspersed with the text is a number of useful charts and maps.

The dust-jacket tells us that the author, Xavier Léon-Dufour, is the foremost NT scholar in France, and considered by many to be the premier Catholic NT scholar in Europe. He is obviously well at home in the world of the NT, and most of the articles combine conciseness of definition with a valuable collection of biblical references from both the Old and New Testaments. Entries under proper names and material objects receive careful definition, and some biblical concepts (e.g. justification) are handled with commendable lucidity. On the other hand, it is surprising that some key NT words (e.g. righteousness, sanctification) receive no treatment at all, and others are hard to find: e.g., unless the reader knows the Greek *arrhabon*, it is not easy to find the 'seal' of 2 Corinthians 1:22; 5:5 and Ephesians 1:14 under 'pledge'.

Occasionally there are statements which make one wonder: on p.66 it is stated that 'Jesus was filled with reverence for [the OT], even though he seems not to have quoted it except in cases of controversy' (p.66). Terence Prendergast's translation reads well, though there are occasional infelicities such as 'to concretely reveal his love ...' (p.75), and the phrase 'vassals with a power ...' on p.27 suggests a misunderstanding of the French *d'*, which should here be translated 'of'.

## CHURCHMAN

These are pardonable blemishes in what is a book of excellent quality and enduring reference value. Well-produced, its price is reasonable for a work of such continual usefulness.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

## CHRISTIAN WORDS NIGEL TURNER

T. and T. Clark 1980 513pp. £13.00

ISBN 0 567 09301 8

This is a magisterial volume. The author, Nigel Turner, has already contributed to the *New Peake Commentary*, the *Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*, *Hastings' Dictionary of the Bible* and *Manson's Companion to the Bible*, and has also been active in translating for the Bible Society's *Translator's New Testament*. This experience is reflected in the wide reading documented in the notes, and in the way the author is at home in the world of the classical Greek and Latin authors, as well as that of the rabbis, the Fathers, and contemporary scholarship.

The 'Christian words' (and there are over 370 of them) consist of Greek terms which, so far as the writer knows, the first believers devised for themselves; together with other terms already in the language 'which acquire a deeper sense and a new consecration within the Christian vocabulary' (p.x). The variety of translations in use today will make it difficult to track down some words, as they are arranged alphabetically according to a somewhat arbitrary English translation (thus *anamnesis* is 'memorial sacrifice' and *gala* is 'nourishing teaching'), but there is a full index of Greek words dealt with, which will be of help to the reader with a knowledge of Greek.

The book will be of value for exegesis, although it lacks the popular touch of William Barclay's *New Testament Words*, but the careful references appended after each letter section bring the reader up to date with theological discussion that has taken place since Barclay did his work. It is difficult to know the principle by which the writer has made his selection: for instance, under 'wait for', there is a discussion of *apekdechomai* (p.490), but no reference to the more graphic *apokaradokia* of Romans 8:19. On controversial matters (as e.g., *anamnesis* and *hilasterion*) the author refers helpfully to opposing viewpoints, and quotes writers like Leon Morris as well as those of other outlook. It is surprising that he does not refer to David Gregg's Grove liturgical study on the use of *anamnesis*.

Ministers and others who seek to teach the Bible will find this a useful reference tool.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

## GOSPEL PERSPECTIVES : Studies of History and Tradition in the Four Gospels Vol. 2

edited R. T. FRANCE and DAVID WENHAM

JSOT Press, Sheffield 1981 375pp. £8.95

ISBN 0 905774 31 0

This is the second volume to have emerged from the Gospels Research Project of Tyndale House, Cambridge. The aim, as before, is to look at the ever-important question of the historicity of the gospels, and to provide answers which will 'stand up to serious academic scrutiny and will provide some help for those who are perplexed by scholarly disagreement' (p.5). There are



eleven essays in all. Four deal with the gospels in general (the quest for the historical Jesus; the genre of the gospels; the empty tomb; and the parables). Six consider problems raised by individual gospels (the infancy narratives in Matthew; an analysis of the sources behind Luke 1-2, and of the announcement in Luke 4; historical tradition in the fourth gospel; tradition and redaction in John 21; and the common ground between John and Matthew). The final study probes the overlap between Paul's eschatological teaching and that found in the synoptic gospels.

Taken together, these two volumes make available some very useful and informed discussion of two particular areas which are of continuing importance in any study of the NT gospels, especially in relation to the issue of their historicity. First, the question of *method* is widely discussed, and we are reminded of the danger of claiming more for the evidence than it actually allows, and also of the pervading influence of one's prior assumptions. Second, the *nature* of the gospel tradition is thoroughly examined, and we are made aware that from the start (in a wide range of gospel material) history and interpretation have been carefully balanced. A further significant element in both books is that they have opened up some potentially valuable avenues for future research; and it is good to know that in the next stage of the project the highly important category of 'midrash' is to be investigated in the context of the gospels.

In volume 2, as in its predecessor, we are provided with first-rate conservative scholarship on the part of writers who are concerned not only to re-examine the issue of historicity in the NT, and to liberate gospel scholarship from needless scepticism, but also (and refreshingly!) to challenge the methods of their evangelical academic colleagues. Throughout the approach is a positive one: to enable the church to hear, see and follow 'the Jesus of the Gospels' (p.7).

May a plea be entered for the inclusion of indexes in any further editions of these two helpful volumes?

Coventry Cathedral

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY

## THE SYNOPTIC PROBLEM: A Critical Analysis WILLIAM R. FARMER

first published 1964

Mercer University Press, USA 1976 308pp. \$18.95 ISBN 0 915948 02 8

It is remarkable that a book published in 1964, and apparently taken over by another press in 1976, should be sent unchanged for review in 1981. Few books would justify this treatment, yet Farmer's does. No one knew in 1964 whether his powerful attack on Markan priority and on Q would cause more than a ripple on the placid waters of synoptic criticism. Now it is clear that he has caused a storm which shows no signs of abating. In the first number of *New Testament Abstracts* for 1981, representing four months of scholarly publication throughout the world, there are nine articles in the synoptics section which seems to bear directly on the synoptic problem. *No fewer than eight of these attack or question either Markan priority or Q.*

Farmer's work, it is widely acknowledged, is more convincing in its demolition than in its reconstruction. He revives the Owen-Griesbach hypothesis: the Greek Matthew came first; Matthew was used by Luke; Mark was produced from the other two. This hypothesis has in its favour the statement of Clement of Alexandria (c. 150-215) that the gospels with genealogies were

written before those without. But it is hard to believe that the lively and vivid narrative of Mark was built up out of alternating extracts from Matthew and Luke. Further, when it comes to one of his most crucial arguments (about a correlation between agreement in order and agreement in wording), he makes this devastating admission: 'It is very important not to think that this correlation can be easily verified. There are places where no correlation seems apparent' (p.219, n.9).

It is to be devoutly hoped that Farmer's reopening of the synoptic question will lead to further attempts at reconstruction. For one thing is certain: there is a relation between the first three gospels which, if properly stated, would be consistent with all the data.

Oxford

JOHN WENHAM

## **FOLLOWING JESUS : Discipleship in the Gospel of Mark**

**ERNEST BEST**

Journal for the Study of the New Testament

Supplement Series 4

*JSOT Press, Sheffield 1981 283pp. hardcover £15.00 ISBN 0 905774 29 9*  
*paperback £8.95 ISBN 0 905774 28 0*

This book is a good example of the practical outworking of mainstream source, form and redaction criticism. Mark's gospel is held to be independent of Matthew and Luke, written in Rome for a persecuted church round about AD 70. Mark had the use of stories and sayings which were current in the church, which broadly he believed to be true. These he adapted and fitted together, with the help of liberal quantities of cement of his own making, in order to provide his community with a book of instruction on discipleship. The centre of the instruction portrays a journey from Caesarea Philippi to Jerusalem—a journey of Mark's own creation—which is intended to depict the Christian pilgrimage of his readers. Jesus leads and accompanies his followers on a journey towards the cross and into mission.

All this is worked out with concise, detailed and well-read argument in the currently approved fashion. The question of the historical truth of the traditions used by the evangelist receives little attention, being regarded as irrelevant to the understanding of his intentions. But as far as his own original work is concerned, it is held that the evangelist was not very well informed about Palestine and that he had no compunction about inventing matter to serve the purposes of his story. Much attention is given to the sophisticated guesswork which claims to separate traditions from redactions, and even at times to show the contrareity of these one to another.

In evaluating this approach, two things should be remembered. On the one hand, the second-century church thought the gospels to be sound history deriving from the apostles, and not community traditions manipulated by ill-informed redactors. On the other, the commonly accepted findings of source and form criticism are being sharply challenged today, and it is certainly not necessary to take a sceptical view of the evangelists' editing. Some of us believe that there is a ring of truth about the gospel narratives and that they tell us about the Jesus of history. But Best's book provides a good illustration of how Mark's gospel looks to one who sees it primarily as a source of information about instruction in the early church.

Oxford

JOHN WENHAM

**THE GOSPEL ACCORDING TO ST JOHN Volume 2**  
**RUDOLF SCHNACKENBURG**

first published in Germany 1971

Burns and Oates 1980 556pp. £22.50

ISBN 0 86012 056 2

The scholarly world (and at this price few ministers and lay folk will buy it) has waited a long time for this commentary. Volume 1, covering John 1-4, was published in 1968; and although the German edition of Volume 2 came out in 1971, the English translation has taken nine years to appear. This is strange, since Volume 1 was widely praised, and one would have thought that the publishers had ample incentive to keep the pot boiling. It is all the stranger that this volume shows such signs of hasty preparation. There are glaring proof-reading errors, especially in the headings and the footnotes (which occupy ninety-seven pages at the end of the book). For instance, the numbering of the footnotes does not match the notes themselves in one section of the introduction. The book is also difficult to use as a commentary, because references are not provided at the top of each page.

Having had my grouse (and at this price one expects better production), I must turn to praise. The translation flows well: rarely did I feel that I was reading 'translation-ese', which is quite an achievement, since four people have worked on the translation and German is notorious in this respect. In fact, the language is quite lyrical in places, reflecting the enthusiasm which the author plainly feels for his subject. This tone is refreshing and infectious, for a tome of this size from a German is daunting, and one honestly expects to be bored stiff with heavy Teutonic theologizing. But in Schnackenburg's case it is plainly *amor Johannis*, and not solely German thoroughness, which has led him to write at such length. *O si sic omnes!*

He is a conservative Catholic. His conservatism appears in his view of the unity of the gospel: he is prepared to accept it as it stands, assuming 'that the fourth gospel is essentially the work of one man' (p.438)—which is remarkably out of step with recent Johannine scholarship—although he allows the influence of redactors, accepting, for instance, Bultmann's view that the reference to a future *eschaton* were added at a later stage (though not accepting that the evangelist would have been in radical disagreement with the redactor in this case). His Catholicism appears in this volume particularly in his exposition of chapter 6, where he undertakes a strongly sacramental interpretation of the 'Bread of Life' discourse. But here he is by no means merely following a party line: he is fair to other viewpoints, and fully discusses the implications of his own position.

The commentary is interspersed with excursuses on special topics (such as the 'I am' sayings, and the title 'the Son', and there are other shorter notes inserted into the exposition as matters arise. These could well have been listed on the contents page, or separately. With this volume, Schnackenburg takes his commentary up to chapter 12: I sincerely hope that we will not have to wait so long for the English version of his third volume (which has already appeared in German) and that it will not be so prohibitively expensive when it appears. While commending this book as well worth having, full of careful and convincing exegesis, I should perhaps be hoping that rich aunts, rather than their nephews, will read this review!

Oak Hill College, London

STEPHEN MOTYER

**ROMANS** Volume 1 chapters 1-8  
**WILLIAM HENDRIKSEN**

Banner of Truth 1980 301pp. hardcover £5.25  
 limp £3.95

ISBN 0 85151 324 7

William Hendriksen has been writing NT commentaries since 1939, though British editions of his *More than Conquerors* and *The Gospel of John* did not appear until 1947 and 1959 respectively. *Romans 1-8* is the eleventh commentary to come from his pen. He will be well known to most readers of *Churchman* as a warm-hearted and judicious NT scholar who writes firmly from within the Reformed, conservative and evangelical tradition. However, his writings are also marked by a knowledge of, and respect for, the views of scholars outside that tradition.

In his foreword, Hendriksen writes: 'A heart-warming book is Romans. It is filled with instruction touching both life and doctrine.' Heart-warming and instructive are epithets which might also be applied to his own book. Nevertheless, with the flood of commentaries on Romans showing no signs of abating, prospective buyers will want to know just what kind of commentary Hendriksen has written. Briefly, we may say that he has given a lucid and straightforward commentary which is at once more readable than John Murray's and less detailed than C. E. B. Cranfield's. Greek words are not transliterated but are confined to footnotes.

It may be most helpful to draw attention to his treatment of certain key questions and passages. On the question of the composition of the church at Rome, Hendriksen concludes that most of the members were Christians from the Gentiles, though the exact proportion of Jews to Gentiles is unknown. He makes the interesting suggestion that 'among the various units composing this church, there may have been at least one, a house church, in which not the Gentiles but the Jews predominated numerically.' It is surprising that P. Minear's house-church theory is not even mentioned at this point.

Commenting on 1:17, Hendriksen disagrees with Cranfield and is convinced that *ek pisteōs* should be connected with *zēsetai* and not with *dikaios*. On the point as to whether Paul uses the verb to *justify* or the noun *justification* in a causative or a declarative sense, no reference is made to Barrett's discussion; nor to P. Ziesler's contention that the verb is used 'relationally', often with the forensic meaning, but the noun and the adjective have 'behavioural' meanings. Hendriksen says *dikaioō* in 3:24 is used in 'the dominant forensic sense, to justify means to declare righteous; and justification may be defined as that gracious act of God whereby, on the basis of Christ's accomplished mediatorial work, he declares the sinner just, and the latter accepts this benefit with a believing heart'.

In 3:25, *hilastērion* is translated 'wrath-removing or propitiatory sacrifice'. The arguments for 'mercy seat' (AV), especially with T. W. Manson's suggestion that *proetheto* be translated by 'displayed', are not considered.

On 5:1, he argues strongly for 'We have peace' rather than 'Let us have peace'. On 5:12ff., he says Paul 'obviously means that the entire human race was included in Adam, so that when Adam himself sinned, all sinned; when the process of death began to ruin *him*, it immediately affected the entire race.' Nevertheless, in 5:12 *eph'hō* is 'probably to be interpreted inferentially', and 'since all sinned' in all probability 'refers to sins all people have themselves committed after they were born.'

In 6:7, 'is freed from sin' means 'is now truly *free, justified* in God's sight.'

Hendriksen maintains that the difficulties of 7:2-4 are resolved once it is recognized that 'as it is a *death* that dissolves the marriage bond, so it is also a *death* that dissolves the legal bond; i.e. the bondage to law.'

On 7:14-25, he rejects the view of Ridderbos that the passage portrays a man apart from Christ—a person engaged in a desperate struggle under the law—and the suggestion that it refers to an immature believer. He holds that 'the regenerated individual, Paul, is describing his own condition and that of believers generally.' However, he fails to make clear the distinction between a rhetorical-general pre-Christian interpretation (e.g. of Kummel and Althaus) and an autobiographical-general pre-Christian interpretation (e.g. of Dodd and W. D. Davies). The compromise positions of Mitton and John A. T. Robinson are mentioned, but dismissed as 'interesting and instructive, but to me not entirely convincing!' Salvation-history interpretations (e.g. of Benoit and Lyonnet), existentialist interpretations (e.g. of Bultmann and Bornkamm), and mediating views (e.g. of Kuss and Kertelge) are not discussed.

On 8:26, he argues cogently that the 'unspoken groanings' are the 'unspoken words of the Spirit' and not those of God's children. No mention is made specifically of Käsemann's view that 'what is at issue is the praying in tongues of I Corinthians 14:15.'

There is much of value in this commentary and it is certainly good value for money. As a first commentary on Romans it could be an ideal acquisition. However, for those already possessing Murray and Cranfield, Hendriksen will hardly be indispensable.

Oak Hill College, London

PETER PYCHES

## **1 & 2 CORINTHIANS** The New Century Bible Commentary F. F. BRUCE

*first published in 1971*

*Eerdmans, USA 1980*

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1981 262pp. £3.95*

USA ISBN 0 8028 1839 0

UK ISBN 0 551 00845 8

## **PHILIPPIANS** The New Century Bible Commentary RALPH P. MARTIN

*first published in 1976*

*Eerdmans, USA 1980*

*Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1981 176pp. £3.95*

USA ISBN 0 8028 1840 4

UK ISBN 0 551 00595 5

*The New Century Bible Commentary*, edited for the NT by Professor Matthew Black and based on the Revised Standard Version, is now being issued in paperback for the first time. Among the first volumes to appear in this format are those by two distinguished and conservative scholars, both of whom (like the present reviewer) have taught in the University of Manchester: Professors F. F. Bruce and R. P. Martin.

The work of Professor Bruce on 1 and 2 Corinthians is, as we would expect, a model of sound scholarship, wise opinion and exegetical skill. The author writes with clarity and conciseness, and illuminates the text where necessary with information drawn from Jewish and Greek (including 'pre-gnostic') religious life and thought. In the process we are made fully aware from the Corinthian correspondence of the problems involved when Christianity is planted in a pagan environment (problems which are still with us!); and we are also given some rich insights into the mind of Paul himself. Bruce argues for the structural unity of 1 Corinthians, and for the integrity of 2 Corinthians, even if (in his view) 2 Corinthians 10-13 may have been despatched to Corinth later than chapters 1-9.

Unlike Bruce, Professor Martin has used the opportunity of this reissue to make some minor corrections and to supplement his bibliography (he lists some of the major studies in this area of Paul which have appeared since 1975). Martin argues in his introduction for the authenticity and unity of Philippians, and for Ephesus as its possible place of origin. In his comments he writes technically but lucidly, and often with an eye to the practical relevance of the text. Like Bruce, Martin also takes helpful note from time to time of the Greek text, which is transliterated.

We welcome both of these volumes in their revised format, as invaluable and up-to-date aids for all students of the NT.

Coventry Cathedral

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY

**STUDIA BIBLICA 1978 : Papers on Paul and Other New Testament Authors**  
**Journal for the Study of the New Testament**  
**Supplement Series 3**

edited E. A. LIVINGSTONE

JSOT Press, Sheffield 1980 468pp. £16.50

ISBN 0 905774 27 2

This volume completes the publication of papers and 'communications' presented at the Sixth International Congress on Biblical Studies at Oxford in 1978. It appears from the JSOT Press in their usual form: photolithoed typescript justified on the left only (though this does not seem significantly to have reduced the price), and the quality of production is distinctly poor; misprints abound, even to the extent that one lady contributor suffers a sex-change on the contents page.

Thirty-nine articles are included, of greatly varying length, quality and interest. Thirty-seven are in English, one in German, and one in French, and the contributors represent many more nationalities. Four articles are twenty pages or more in length (the longest—an indifferent offering by J. M. Gibbs, which ought to have been pruned—is thirty-seven pages long), but most cover six to eight pages. Some articles cover exceedingly obscure and specialized subjects, and seem out of place in a general volume of this sort: such as J. N. Birdsall on 'The Georgian Version of Revelation', or Julien Ries (in French) on 'The Christology of the Manichees'. However, most of them will be of interest to anyone with a passion for the New Testament.

Articles that stand out for their theological and exegetical competence come from the pens of D. H. Campbell, W. S. Campbell, Paul Ellingworth, Martin Hengel, Colin Hickling, Sophie Laws, Heikki Raisanen, Graham Stanton, A. J. M. Wedderbury, R. Williamson, and Tom Wright. Space does not permit comment on all these, but I must pick out a few. Hengel gives us twenty-five brilliant pages on 'Hymn and Christology', a study of the hymns preserved in the New Testament and an assessment of their influence on the Christology of the early church; Colin Hickling and Heikki Raisanen direct some penetrating criticisms at Paul, asking him to defend himself against charges of inconsistency in his teaching on the law, on Israel, on eschatology; Paul Ellingworth provides a fascinating study of Hebrews 12:3 and its OT ancestry; Graham Stanton illuminates Acts 6 and 7 with a very careful study of the accusations against Stephen and their relationship to his speech of defence; and Tom Wright establishes once and for all, with a lovely piece of exegesis, the rightness of 'for a sin offering' as the translation of *peri hamartias* in Romans 8:3.

It is well worth getting out of the local library for a week, if not worth buying.

Oak Hill College, London

STEPHEN MOTYER

## PAUL THE APOSTLE : The Triumph of God in Life and Thought J. CHRISTIAAN BEKER

Fortress Press, USA 1980

T. and T. Clark 1980 452pp. £11.95

ISBN 0 567 09309 3

This fine addition to the books on Paul's theology is to be welcomed because, unlike for instance those of Whiteley, Ridderbos or even Sanders, this analysis of Paul's thought attempts to do justice to *both* its coherent structure *and* its contingent expression in the particular situations of the churches of the Gentile mission. Beker, professor of biblical theology at Princeton Theological Seminary, rightly locates Paul's hermeneutical genius in his ability to make the coherent core of his gospel a word on target for a variety of situations. When it comes to stating what constitutes that coherent core, Beker is prepared to assert clearly that it is in fact Paul's Christian apocalyptic—his hope in the triumph of God through the imminent redemption of the created order which has been inaugurated in Christ.

The first main part of the book focuses on the contingency of Paul's gospel, demonstrating in particular how the different settings and purposes of Galatians and Romans produce different assertions about faith, the law and the history of salvation within a basic coherence. The last chapter of this section deals with Paul as the interpreter of tradition, especially the Antioch 'gospel tradition', and with the resulting dialectic between the unity of the church and the truth of his gospel. In the latter part of the book, which focuses primarily on the coherence of Paul's theology, Beker works through the topics of the resurrection, the cross, sin and death, the law, salvation, life in Christ, the church, and the destiny of Israel. He attempts to expose the structure of the apostle's thought in these areas and its relation to an apocalyptic perspective, and yet at the same time not to forget the contingency seen in the use of different language and symbol systems in different contexts. Much of the discussion of prominent texts such as Galatians 3, Romans 4 and 7 and 1 Corinthians 15, and of the major topics, is illuminating and allows the sharp contours and radical nature of Paul's thinking to emerge. It was good not only to find no attempt to move the apocalyptic aspect of Paul's thought to the periphery, but also to discover an unwillingness, for example, to dilute Paul's critique of the law, to apply Romans 7 to Paul's Christian experience (it is treated as a Christian perspective on the Jew's experience under the law), to accept *simul iustus et peccator* as an adequate depiction of Paul's view of the believer's life (instead, sin for the believer is the 'impossible possibility'), or to adopt a revisionist exegesis which makes Paul more 'progressive' than he really was on the social issues of his day.

The major weaknesses of Beker's interpretation of Paul's thought lie in his omissions. He accepts only the undisputed Pauline letters as sources, but even so writes almost as if 1 Thessalonians and Philippians did not exist. Despite his insistence on the importance of Jewish apocalyptic for Paul's gospel, his treatment of apocalyptic is very brief, relying on Koch's characterization of it and presenting no discussion of apocalyptic texts. His treatment does not do justice to the large element in apocalyptic which deals with revelations about, and present experience of, the heavenly world. This in turn leads, in my view, to errors of judgement about 'realized eschatology' in

## CHURCHMAN

Paul and an inability to see how the eschatological perspective of Colossians or even Ephesians could be related to the apocalyptic core of Paul's gospel (for elaboration of this point, see my *Paradise Now and Not Yet*, CUP 1981). At this point and others, Beker also works with an outmoded sharp distinction between Hellenistic and Palestinian thought. Beker is right to want to correct an excessively Christocentric interpretation of Paul by putting the emphasis on the triumph of *God*, but one is also left with more than a suspicion that in the process his own interpretation does not give sufficient attention to Paul's Christology.

Despite such deficiencies, *Paul the Apostle* is a stimulating and important study which, in its efforts to do better justice to the contingency of Paul's thought, marks an advance amongst the major attempts to write a Pauline theology and which will give students a good overall perspective for their own wrestling with the apostle's writings.

St John's College, Nottingham

A. T. LINCOLN

## EVANGELICAL THEOLOGY : An Introduction

KARL BARTH translated GROVER FOLEY

*first published in Germany 1963*

*Eerdmans, USA 1979*

*T. and T. Clark 1979 206pp. £2.95*

ISBN 0 567 29053 0

'First printed 1979' inside the front cover is a bit misleading because, of course, this book first appeared in German in 1963 and was immediately translated by Grover Foley and published in that same year in English by Weidenfeld and Nicolson. The only alteration in the present publication is the addition of a seven-page 'foreword to the American edition'. (The first edition was reissued in *The Churchman* in September 1964.)

This is a splendid introduction to Barth, and certainly the book to recommend to anyone who wants to find out what Barth is about. It is easier to read than, for example, *Dogmatics in Outline*, and it is incomparably shorter than the *Church Dogmatics*. The first few chapters, originally delivered as lectures during Barth's American tour of 1962, speak of the nature and place of theology in the life of the church. We are reminded that theology is a science, working strictly within rules (rules not, of course, dictated to it by some other discipline, but determined for it by the divine self-disclosure itself). We are reminded, too, of Barth's constant refrain that all theology is really looking at Jesus and recounting what we see. Here are the pillars of Barth's theological method.

But this is more than an introduction to Barth. It is an introduction to theology: not in the sense that here, in draft outline, are the chapters that a self-respecting systematics would have to write, but rather in the sense that this is how the theologian understands the nature of his task—this is how he approaches his desk and does his daily work (it is an introduction to *doing* theology).

In the section on 'Theological Existence' (by which Barth means 'how theology encounters a man...how it confronts him, enters into him, and assumes concrete form in him', p.63), there are chapters on 'Wonder', 'Concern', 'Commitment' and 'Faith'. Under 'The Threat to Theology' (by which he means those aspects surrounding the theologian's task which inevitably assail him, but which in the nature of things he cannot hope to escape), he writes on 'Solitude', 'Doubt', 'Temptation' and 'Hope'; and in a final section



headed 'Theological Work' there are chapters on 'Prayer', 'Study', 'Service' and 'Love'. Characteristically, Barth manages throughout to combine lofty theological purpose with pastoral sensitivity and an undercurrent of humour. Theology is made to seem a noble task, yet, at the same time, a happy one.

This is definitely a book every student of theology should read: those at the beginning of their course who might well wonder what precisely it is on which they are embarking and how best they should approach their task; but also those who have been under way for some time, yet need to be reminded afresh what the theological task involves and how theological study should be pursued. And what good value for money!

Wycliffe Hall, Oxford

A. L. MOORE

## SURE FOUNDATION DONALD COGGAN

Hodder and Stoughton 1981 319pp. £5.95

ISBN 0 340 26357 1

Shortly before leaving Southwark I asked a senior priest, who had been in the diocese throughout my episcopate, to tell me the 'high light' of our spiritual experiences. He replied, 'Donald Coggan's biblical addresses at the Butlin's Conference at Bognor in 1961.' Twenty years later—and I am now in retirement in Bath—I asked my local parish priest, who had been at his diocesan 'get-together', not at Butlin's but at a conference house more suitable and restrained, to tell me whether it had been worthwhile. 'Yes', he said, 'Donald Coggan's talks on the Bible were outstanding. For those alone it was worth it.'

I find it difficult to find words adequate to express my gratitude and my admiration for his latest book *Sure Foundation*. It is packed with scriptural wisdom and challenge. It is also packed, and this is a rare gift, with scriptural insight and prophecy.

It is little short of a miracle that Donald Coggan managed to think and write as much as he did during his years as bishop and primate. Be that as it may, his devotion to Scripture, his loyalty to the church, and his alertness of mind, are apparent on every page.

Donald Coggan, with his reputation as an evangelical, would be expected to expound the Scriptures for the furtherance of personal spirituality. Those who look for such an emphasis will not be disappointed. I commend especially his addresses on 'Church and Ministry' (pp.181-250).

But Coggan was no party man. He had a catholic approach to the faith of the church and its implications. In sermon after sermon he emphasizes the social and political duties of a Christian. As he wandered the streets of South London, he was under no illusions with regard to the consequences of racism, unemployment and high-rise and slum buildings. Leaders of all political parties might do well to buy a copy of the book.

Having said that, it is impossible to understand Coggan unless his basic slogan is remembered. 'Knowledge alone will not give men the clue they need to the meaning of their life and destiny.' Only a personal experience of God, through Jesus Christ in the power of the Holy Spirit, can supply the remedy.

As one who was called to the top job in the Anglican Communion, it is interesting to note the ingredients he believes to be necessary for leadership: moral courage, self-discipline, unselfishness, and vision. Unlike some doctors, Dr Coggan has demonstrated the efficacy of his own prescriptions. Long may he live and long may he devote his tireless energies to the exposition of the Scriptures.

Bath, Avon

+ MERVYN STOCKWOOD

**OUR CHRISTIAN FAITH : Answers for the Future**

**KARL RAHNER and KARL-HEINZ WEGER**

translated F. McDONAGH

*first published in Germany*

*Burns and Oates 1980 179pp. £3.95*

ISBN 0 86012 108 9

**THE COURAGE TO PRAY** **KARL RAHNER and**

**JOHANN BAPTIST METZ** translated S. O'BRIEN TWOHIG

*first published in Germany 1977*

*Burns and Oates 1980 87pp. £2.50*

ISBN 0 86012 107 0

These two additions to what has become an established series of relatively short paperbacks, continue and extend the opportunity of 'listening-in' to what is primarily an RC discussion, in which Karl Rahner, with others enlisted also, is endeavouring to meet the obvious theological and practical difficulties encountered at the parish and pastoral level in Continental Catholicism. They reflect especially the German situation (they were first of all published by Herder) and exhibit the defensive position in which the Roman Catholic leadership finds itself there. Yet at the same time there is much, particularly in the first of these, where eavesdroppers can hear what may well be good for themselves. Rahner and Weger contribute to a dialogue or debate, in which problems of Christian faith are propounded by Weger and answered by Rahner. Weger raises not just abstract theological problems, but all the basic affirmations of Christianity—belief in God, the significance of Jesus, revelation, redemption through the cross and the resurrection, and membership of the church—in ways as they are seen by many in our modern society who have given up wearily to a practical atheism, or at least a sad, frustrated sceptical attitude of those sufficiently educated to ask but not to expect an answer. He begins each chapter with his questioning; nine sets of problems, with a final chapter that attempts to sum up the whole debate and perhaps is the least useful of the lot.

The questioning is not always from the same stance: it can be from one who talks like a perplexed agnostic, and yet in another as from a fringe Catholic. Rahner replies with a comment upon the problems raised, attempting sensitively to respond both to the mood as well as to the actual terms of the question, for it is clear that the mood engendered by the modern cultural and social environment have much to do with the way the present discussion is slanted and indeed experienced. Anyone conversant with Rahner's approach will not be surprised to find his emphasis upon the profound mystery of the Godhead with whom we have to do, and the manifold indications implied by our own being and existential experience of this fathomless presence, within which we may become aware as to how superficial our sense of meaninglessness in existence really is. He finds many of the forms of the questions structured by just this very lack of awareness of the dimensions of the theme to which they relate, and points again and again as to a more profitable way of seeing them. But Rahner also clearly distances himself from a mere re-affirmation of traditional theology: he notes critically that preaching too often takes the great fundamental themes for granted without constantly seeking to make them credible. Indeed, he goes further and calls attention to a 'fundamental change . . . taking place not only in non-Christian ideas, but also within Christianity and its theology.' By this he apparently means, not so much the mistaken reconstructions of radical Protestantism, but some different methodology at work on the great affirmations of the faith. The style of Rahner's contribution here is lighter than in some of his writings, but it would probably make a fair demand upon a reader unused to his work.

In the second book, Metz offers six very short comments upon different aspects or terms of prayer, and they are worth pondering for further development. They are not conventional devotion: 'Prayer and Politics' and 'Prayer as Resistance' indicate unusual approaches and are part of his deeper concern for our commitment to our past, our great fellowship of God's people right back to the OT, and our share in the age-long practice of prayer with them in which we continue to enter into the unfinished suffering of the saints, and actually anticipate in hope. From this Rahner takes up the theme of the saints, their veneration, and prayer to them; again attempting to persuade a reluctant Catholic audience, now evidently finding this form of devotion less appealing. Upon the basis of Metz' theme, he is able to expound the love for one's neighbour as applicable to the communion of saints, including the departed. But the extension of this to include regarding them as intercessors, while yet not coming between us and God, but as part of the great community in worship, is hardly persuasive. No mention is made of the total silence of Scripture in this matter.

The two books have been well translated by Francis McDonagh and Sarah O'Brien Twohig.

Archdeaconry of Auckland, Durham

G. J. C. MARCHANT

## **EXPLORATIONS IN THEOLOGY 8 GEOFFREY LAMPE**

SCM Press 1981 150pp. £5.50

ISBN 0 334 01979 6

This collection of papers was planned before Geoffrey Lampe's sudden death in August 1980, but has now been published posthumously. It reflects Lampe's wide range of expertise and interests, and represents both an excellent introduction and welcome addition to his writings.

Lampe's characteristic liberalism in theology is evident here in three different areas. First, in matters of church ministry and order, where he argues convincingly that well-grounded theological reasons for barring women from the priesthood do not exist, and that non-episcopal ordination of ministers should not be an obstacle to union with other churches. He refuses to be imprisoned by tradition, being adept at drawing unexpected lessons from the past which point in a progressive direction.

Secondly, Lampe's liberalism reveals itself in the spirit of free critical inquiry which marks his biblical exegesis. This approach appears highly productive in his handling of the difficult 'two swords' saying in Luke 22:38. Lampe throws helpful light on this by viewing it in conjunction with Luke's treatment of the assault on the high priest's slave. The related papers on Revelation 19:10 and 'Martyrdom and Inspiration' suggest close links between the roles of prophet and martyr in the early church.

Thirdly, Lampe's liberalism extended to criticism of traditional formulations of Christian doctrine. 'What Future for the Trinity?' and 'The Essence of Christianity' reveal his dissatisfaction with the church's ancient creeds. 'The classical interpretation of Jesus as incarnate Logos-Son runs out... either into a docetic Christ or into a dual personality, now human, now divine' (p.124). Lampe prefers a Christology of inspiration and indwelling by God's Spirit to one of hypostatic union. In my view, a pre-existent Christ remains a necessary corollary to the Christ exalted at God's right hand. Perhaps Lampe's agnosticism over the historicity of the resurrection blinds him to the factors pressing most strongly towards an incarnational Christology.

The most telling criticism of liberalism concerns its tendency to make current fashion and acceptability a yardstick for the church's presentation of

its faith. Sometimes, as Lampe suggests, God may well speak to the church through secular developments. But in 'Salvation: Traditions and Reappraisals', Lampe seems over-eager to trim the Christian message to fit contemporary understanding. Thus it is assumed, rather than argued, that sin today should be seen primarily in terms of social evil rather than as individual disobedience towards God. Traditional interpretations of the atonement are likewise discounted too easily. A rather bland version of Christianity is the result. For all its perceptive and persuasive qualities, Lampe's theology ultimately suffers from lack of a vital cutting edge.

Cranmer Hall, Durham

RICHARD HIGGINSON

## THE MEAL THAT UNITES? DONALD BRIDGE and DAVID PHYPERS

Hodder and Stoughton 1981 192pp. £3.25

ISBN 0 340 26633 3

The eucharist ought to be 'the meal that unites', but it could just as well be called 'the meal that divides'. Faced with that sad fact, and a concern to share their enthusiasm for the eucharist with lay people in the evangelical tradition, the authors, a Baptist and an Anglican, have written this book. They cover in a more popular form much of the ground covered by Y. Brilioth in his classic *Eucharistic Faith and Practice*, which first appeared in English in 1930. Bridge and Phipers include material on the explosive activity of the last fifty years, up to and including the appearance of the *ASB*, and with one eye firmly on the nonconformist traditions.

Nevertheless, I am not going to dispense with Brilioth, and I could not recommend this book. Time and again, the complex questions of eucharistic theology need a more nuanced handling than is offered here. The authors serve up the crude Protestant reading of Christian history that virtually writes off thirteen hundred years of God's involvement with his church:

The Catholic church began to depart from the truth of God's Word early in the second century. False teaching and practice became ever more widespread until, apart from a few notable exceptions here and there, the medieval church became so enmeshed in unscriptural additions and superstitions as to resemble the Antichrist. From this sorry state of affairs the church was rescued by the rediscovery of the Word of God and the Reformation in the sixteenth century. That may be an over-simplification, but it roughly covers the state of affairs (p.177).

With that backdrop, history becomes a matter of cartoon 'goodies' and 'baddies'.

So, the Catholic is accused of preoccupation with the validity of the eucharist ('anxious ascertaining that the required actions are performed when the words of institution are repeated' p.176) at the beginning of a discussion in which the question of validity is called 'pressing and crucial', one which 'divides Protestant from Protestant' (p.177). A paper by J. M. R. Tillard, the Dominican, 'demonstrates how Roman Catholic dogma can be presented in a form (on the surface and for some distance under the surface) much more acceptable to Protestants' (p.159, my italics). What does that dark saying suggest? When the ARCIC 'Joint Agreed Statement on the Eucharist' is quoted to the effect that, through the prayer of consecration, 'the bread and the wine become the body and blood of Christ by the action of the Holy Spirit, so that in communion we eat the flesh of Christ and drink his blood', the comment is, 'Needless to say, Protestants will be coughing by the time they read these last words, if not before' (p.160). What a pity that the

voices of Luther, Calvin (quoted on page 101), and Cranmer are drowned by the coughing! Suspicion-mindedness extends to the *ASB* for we are told (p.150) that it includes provision for the reservation of the sacrament after a communion service, and the practice of reservation is later dismissed with the words, 'Jesus, the Lord of glory and eternal King, cannot be confined to bread and wine, nor can he be locked away in a little cupboard!' (p.172). What the *ASB* actually says is: 'Any consecrated bread and wine which is not required for purposes of communion is consumed at the end of the distribution, or after the service' (*ASB* pp.144,198).

One could go on with many other over-simplifications, misunderstandings and false polarizations in this unfortunate book, but it would serve no useful purpose. It is offered in good faith but I wish it had not been printed.

St Edmund's House, Cambridge

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY

## THE BAPTISMAL LITURGY E. C. WHITAKER

first published 1965

SPCK 1981 106pp. £2.95

ISBN 0 281 03809 0

Canon Whitaker will be known to many readers of *Churchman* as a former GOE examiner, and his book should be known to them from its earlier edition of 1965. That, however, was before even Series 2 Baptism and Confirmation, and the revised volume now available not only includes a review of the initiation services of the *ASB*, together with a look at the Roman Catholic initiation rites of 1969-72, but also pays more attention in the first two chapters (which have been substantially re-written) to the early eastern rites, and brings the chapter of bibliography up to date.

To have the material here presented within the compass of 100 pages is of immense value to the student of liturgy, especially as the author does not confuse his readers with endless quotations of detailed liturgical texts, but confines himself to pointing out trends and their significance. We welcome this revised edition.

Oak Hill College, London

DAVID H. WHEATON

## CHRISTIAN ENGLAND : Its Story to the Reformation

DAVID L. EDWARDS

Collins 1981 351pp. £7.95

ISBN 0 00 215212 6

The title and the preface ('The impact which the Christian religion has made on the lives and imagination of the English people') may lead the reader to believe that he is to be treated to the story of religion among the people in England. This is misleading. What is here is a miscellany, without connecting theme; a story which lurches unsteadily from 'great person' to 'great event'. The reader will be informed (sometimes badly informed—there are serious anachronisms at various points) but will not come to *understand* the development of the Christian religion in England. There is, for instance, no discussion of the way in which the late Anglo-Saxon kings used Christianity as a tool of political consolidation, of the popular urban church movement in

the twelfth century, of the attempts of some bishops to 'reform' the church through stricter control of the clergy, and so on. What we have here is a romantic and élitist view of religion which bears as much relation to the reality as Tolkien's 'Middle Earth' does to life today. The author should have taken more seriously the words which he quotes (and rejects): that 'the truth is that the English are not, and never have been, a religious people', for although it is not wholly true, there is more truth in it than in a view of Christianity which concentrates almost solely on men like Dunstan, Lanfranc, Anselm and Becket. Perhaps 'the church' does look like this from the viewpoint of public school and cathedral deanery, but not from any other point.

New University of Ulster

ALAN ROGERS

**THE FAMILY OF LOVE ALASTAIR HAMILTON**

*James Clarke 1981 177p. £15.00*

ISBN 0 227 67845 1

Classical Reformation studies were, and are, hostile to the left-wing radical movements of the Reformation, and have generally associated them with such movements as the disastrous Peasants' War of 1525, the occupation of Muenster in 1535, antinomianism, sedition, rebellion, and communism. The Reformers generally classed such sectarians as fanatics, determined to undermine the churches, and even destroy the state itself. Catholics, too, added their criticisms, and made of the sect an argument against Protestantism on the grounds that it would always spawn fissiparous sects and destroy the unity of the church.

It is helpful, therefore, to have this analytical and informed study on one aspect of the radical reformation. The book makes a detailed examination of the heterodox sect known as the Family of Love, and indicates the weighty support the movement actually had. It is salutary to be reminded of such names as the distinguished Flemish printer Christoph Plantin, the cartographer Ortelius, the philosopher Lipsius, the biblical scholar Benito Arias Montano, and, indeed, a number of respected humanists. The author provides a detailed study of the career and thought of the two leaders of the sect: the founder Hendrik Niclaes, and Jansen van Barrefelt. He examines the circumstances in which the Family of Love developed, the men who joined it, the grounds of its wide appeal, and the objects it set out to achieve. An important emphasis of the book is to show the number and significance of the sects; that they were less political and more spiritual movements, seeking peace, harmony and concord, and helping each other in the quest of truth. Ultimately, it was on account of the sect's views on Scripture and faith that Protestantism disowned its adherents: the sectarians did not hold justification by faith, nor did they regard Scripture as authoritative. This was anathema to classical Protestantism.

In addition to a good index, the book has full and valuable notes and references: every statement is related to original source material, most of that in old Flemish. Yet it is singularly readable and not at all technical: the author wears his undoubted learning with a light touch. He therefore makes a contribution to sixteenth-century studies in an area where few are so highly qualified to make judgements.

Latimer House, Oxford

JAMES ATKINSON

**THE LETTERS AND DIARIES OF JOHN HENRY  
NEWMAN : Volume IV The Oxford Movement, July 1833 to  
December 1834**

edited IAN Ker and THOMAS GORNALL SJ  
Clarendon Press: OUP 1980 412pp. £20.00

ISBN 0 19 920112 9

**Volume V Liberalism in Oxford, January 1835 to  
December 1836**

edited THOMAS GORNALL SJ  
Clarendon Press: OUP 1981 423pp. £22.50

ISBN 0 19 920117 X

The two volumes should be studied as a pair. They are the most important so far published of the Anglican part of this admirable and exhaustive edition, and cover three and a half years: from a few days before Keble's assize sermon, which Newman considered the start of the Oxford Movement, to a point some months after March 1836, which he called 'a cardinal point of time' in his growth.

Newman, not yet forty, becomes a force in the land. In day-by-day detail the letters (in as well as out) and diaries chart the swift rise of what its proponents then called the 'apostolical' movement, as more and more clergy accepted the thesis of Newman and Keble that the cornerstone of the Church of England must be nothing other than her apostolic succession. These Oxford apostles certainly brought enriching insights. They also brought tragedy. Other students of these volumes may disagree, but I find their story, as it unfolds, depressing. From highest motives, Newman and his friends worked hard to insert a disastrous division into English religion just when unity and evangelism could have reaped a harvest.

The Methodist and evangelical revivals were bearing fruit across the nation. All signs pointed to the nineteenth century becoming the most positively Christian period in English history for two hundred years. Instead, energies were turned aside into bitter inter-Christian wrangles by the Tractarians' flint-like opposition to dissenters, liberals, and 'peculiarities', as Newman dubbed the evangelicals.

Believing he did the will of God, Newman refused even to eat with his brother Francis, who associated with Plymouth Brethren. Keble sent a fellow coach passenger 'to Coventry' on discovering him to be a dissenter. When Whately angrily asks whether Newman had deliberately avoided partaking Communion with him in college chapel, Newman replied that in fact he was unavoidably prevented but indeed wished he could have openly refused to communicate with the Archbishop. Newman tells his sister to make havoc in the Bible Society.

It is all so sad. Sir James Stephen comments to Sam Wilberforce (who passed it on) that Newman's thought and sentiment elevate him far above the evangelicals he despises, yet he makes Christianity harsh and repulsive. He cannot touch the hearts of men: 'in this respect Charles Simeon is worth a legion of Newmans.' These volumes show that Newman, though loved by his intimates, narrowed the love of Christ. How much better if he had said with St Paul, 'Christ is preached, and I therein do rejoice', instead of leading the agitation to keep dissenters out of the university, and persecuting the mildly liberal Hampden, and stirring up controversy wherever he could. The tragedy of the English church at this turning-point of her history comes out more clearly in these eight hundred pages than in the relevant brief passages of the *Apologia* or the biographies.

The editing is impeccable, as usual; though I could wish that in the five volumes still to come the index of persons and places could be widened to

## CHURCHMAN

include subjects, which are difficult now to follow through.

With the main historic themes, there is much to gather along the way, such as the affecting last letters from Hurrell Froude, Newman's great friend who dies in 1836; or a short lived quarrel with Henry Wilberforce, which does both men credit. And on the lighter side appears an itinerary: in 1836 you could get from Oxford to Torbay by stage-coach and steamer for less than £3, including tips!

Rose Ash, Devon

JOHN POLLOCK

### AMAZING GRACE : John Newton's Story JOHN POLLOCK

Hodder and Stoughton 1981 190pp. £1.95

ISBN 0 340 26209 5

John Pollock's compelling biographical studies continue to flow in an apparently unending stream. His more recent books have been accounts of contemporary Christians, notably *The Siberian Seven*. Here in his latest book he returns to the age of *George Whitefield* and *Wilberforce* and presents the story of John Newton, the converted slave-ship captain who became a much-loved Anglican clergyman and hymn writer.

Those who know John Pollock's earlier books might be tempted to assume that what is offered here is a complete biography of the man. Indeed, as one begins to read the volume that is the impression given. However, on page 153, the author declares that 'the present book is the story of that "amazing grace" rather than a full biography of Newton'. It is a pity that one has to get so far into the book to make that discovery. It would have been preferable to spell it out more clearly in the prefatory material. One is tempted to believe that the author originally planned a full-scale biography and then, fairly late in the day, decided to limit his study. However, as we would expect from such an author, what he has given us is a well-written, compelling account of John Newton's experience of the grace of God in Jesus Christ.

In many respects the volume is a commentary on the hymn *Amazing grace*—one of Newton's best-known hymns—hence the title of the book. It traces the biographical details of this 'wretch' who was saved by this 'amazing grace' and how he learned to live by grace. Of course, there are others among the *Olney Hymns* that contain biographical references to Newton's experience, but none is as well known as *Amazing grace*.

Pollock has imbibed the spirit and content of Newton's letters and other documents. Many of them are quoted, thus giving the authentic voice to the narrative. And the author quotes the hymns of Watts and Newton in the same effective and natural way as does his subject in his many letters.

Newton is such an important figure in English hymnody and Anglican evangelicalism that we might be tempted to forget his reprobate beginnings. Newton himself would not let his contemporaries forget them, and John Pollock will not let us overlook them either. *Amazing grace* indeed!

Latimer House, Oxford

ROBIN A. LEAVER

### THE HEAVENLY WITCH : The Story of the Maréchale CAROLYN SCOTT

Hamish Hamilton 1981 260pp. £12.50

ISBN 0 241 10412 2

The Maréchale is one of the great might-have-beens of history. Daughter of



General Booth, Kate early showed outstanding gifts in preaching, courage, leadership, and Christian devotion. At the age of 22, two years after the Christian Mission had become the Salvation Army, she was sent to Paris to start 'the war' in France.

The amazing story of her evangelism among the very poor, the outcasts and the tarts in a bitterly anti-religious city, is told with tremendous verve. Carolyn Scott is clearly a woman of deep faith, and she brings brilliantly alive the persecutions, squalor and triumphs, as this young Englishwoman wins converts against the odds.

Kate Booth moves to Switzerland, where she infuriates smug, staid Calvinists by taking the gospel to the open air and exposing, with a blend of love and scorn, the sins which besmirch their proud Christian heritage. Again she reaches the poorest. Then she is arrested and a *cause célèbre* follows, which even involves the British Foreign Secretary.

An Irish Salvationist of Quaker stock, Arthur Clibborn, had joined her in Paris. They marry in 1888. Arthur Booth-Clibborn later fell under the influence of a religious mountebank. Kate's loyalty to her husband brought a breach with her father. Faults on both sides led Kate in 1902, at the age of 44, to leave the Army. The General regarded this as desertion and cut her out of his life.

The *Maréchale's* ministry became much less significant, even after Arthur shook free of the mountebank. Although she held remarkable missions, almost to the time of her death at a great age in 1955, she lacked a firm base. The marvellous voice, the extraordinary power to bring Christ before men and women, were never again fully used by the Christian church. Towards the end of her life she expressed regret that she had left the Army.

This is the first biography since her death. It deserves a wide readership.

Rose Ash, Devon

JOHN POLLOCK

## THE FLESH IS WEAK : An Intimate History of the Church of England ANDREW BARROW

Hamish Hamilton 1980 254pp. £10.95

ISBN 0 241 10234 0

An erstwhile professional comedian here deals with the Church of England from Cranmer to Runcie. Each of the 448 years gets a section; the author has thus developed a cunning method of getting us to take copious draughts of church history into the system. Some of it is pure farce: the prelate who ruined his chances for Canterbury by stepping on the queen's train; the description of Joseph Butler preaching sermons 'of labyrinthine length' about the brevity of life; the Norfolk parson who had taken 'the unusual and distasteful step of installing his own sanitary system in his pew'.

But there is also a great deal of serious and informative material. Mr Barrow is not only entertaining—he is a responsible and (so far as I can judge) accurate historian, a man with an eye. This is a work which will instruct and delight, and should be added to the required reading of every ordinand. It is illustrated, well indexed, and offers a two-page bibliography for those who wish to go further into a fascinating subject.

St Andrews, Fife

J. D. DOUGLAS

CHURCHMAN

**THE STORY OF TAIZÉ J. L. G. BALADO**

*first published in Spain, 1976*  
Mowbrays 1980 128pp. £1.50

ISBN 0 264 66719 0

**PARABLE OF COMMUNITY BROTHER ROGER**

Mowbrays 1980 96pp. £1.50

ISBN 0 264 66732 8

**LIVING TODAY FOR GOD BROTHER ROGER**

*first published in France, 1959, then in UK 1975*  
Mowbrays 1980 80pp. £1.25

ISBN 0 264 66717 4

**A LIFE WE NEVER DARED HOPE FOR  
BROTHER ROGER**

*first published in France, 1976*  
Mowbrays 1980 78pp. £1.25

ISBN 0 264 66718 2

Of making many books about Taizé there seems no end. The experiment of the community there has fired the imagination of so many in the church, especially the young, that the steady stream of literature is understandable. Fortunately, the study of these four books is unlikely to prove a weariness of the flesh. For one thing, they are short and very readable; for another, they are (in the best sense) inspirational. People ask, What is the secret of Taizé? What is it saying to the complicated, problem-bound world of today? This quartet gives something of the answer, though again and again one feels that only personal acquaintance with this community could make really vivid what is written. This is especially the case with the occasional writings of Brother Roger, who is obviously reflecting a life of remarkable activity in a community of an unusual character. If one has not been to Taizé, one sometimes feels that one is reading a text without a context.

*The Story of Taizé* provides useful background to the other three books. It is not as full as Rex Brico's 'history' (nor as expensive), but it gives a lively picture with plenty of incidents, people and quotations. Certain impressions stand out: the fully ecumenical nature and intention of the community; its commitment to simplicity of heart and life; its concern for the young people of the world; and its extraordinary degree of rapport with them.

The remaining books are by Brother Roger himself. *Parable of Community* contains some of the 'basic texts' of the community, including the Rule, the charter of its communal life, which is striking for its brevity and its obvious intention to leave room for individuals to grow. *Living Today for God* is a kind of commentary on the Rule. Here one finds one of the most characteristic emphases of Taizé, that God desires that all men everywhere shall have a truly human existence.

*A Life We Never Dared Hope For* gives passages from the Prior's personal journal between 1972 and 1974. There is here much genuine graciousness and Christian wisdom. There are profound things to turn over in the mind, perhaps to meditate on during times of prayer; and there are fascinating glimpses into the spiritual life of the man who, under God, has been the inspiration of Taizé from its beginning. A book to ponder and to return to from time to time.

Wheldrake Rectory, York

JOHN COCKERTON

**THE LONERGAN ENTERPRISE**  
**FREDERICK E. CROWE SJ**

Cowley Publications 1980 121pp. US \$5.00

US ISBN 0 93684 02 6

This book, by the author of the Lonergan Centre of Research at Regis College, Toronto, would serve as a most useful initiation into the world of Bernard Lonergan for those who are daunted by the master's work. F. E. Crowe introduces and offers an interpretation of the Lonergan method, and then applies the method to Lonergan's thought. I found the interpretation of method as *organon* most helpful, but felt that his attempt to apply Lonergan to Lonergan a little claustrophobic!

The author, who is committed to the Lonergan enterprise, brings out Lonergan's attempt to investigate the basic structure of theology, his emphasis on the personal involvement of the theologian, and his concern for a constructive framework of creativity. The book is not critical of Lonergan, and does not consider or attempt to answer any criticisms of Lonergan by others (such as E. L. Mascall in *Nature and Supernature*). The book's style is clearly that of the lecture, and it is the written form of the author's 1979 St Michael lectures.

The book intends to point forward to the ongoing Lonergan enterprise rather than back to the Lonergan method, but in my opinion its main attraction lies in its succinct interpretation and appreciation of Lonergan's thought.

St John's College, Durham

PETER ADAM

**DIVINATION AND ORACLES**

edited MICHAEL LOEWE and CARMEN BLACKER

George Allen and Unwin 1981 244pp. £15.00

ISBN 0 04 291016 1

A single individual cannot write a critical review of a book by nine experts, each of whom covers one country or religion. But, with some general knowledge of the subject of divination (man's attempts to discover by material means) and oracles (professing to come from gods or spirits), it is easy to increase one's knowledge, and to appreciate the similarities and differences in each field. Each chapter has evident authority and can be trusted.

The chapter on Tibet is the only one by an author, Lama Chime Radha Rinpoche, who has been involved in the practices about which he writes, although Prof. R. B. Serjeant includes some personal experiences under Islam.

Other writers are inevitably more academic, since they deal with what belongs to the past, even though recently discovered records can now be read. Readers of *Churchman* may not realize how much is now known of the practises of Israel's neighbours, and the light this throws on some OT references. Thus Prof. Gurney writes on the Babylonians and Hittites, and Dr J. D. Ray on ancient Egypt. The actual chapter on the OT is interestingly written by Prof. J. R. Porter, who assembles more examples than the average reader is aware of, although, in the opinion of this reviewer, he is over-reluctant to admit mediumship in anything approaching the modern sense.

A full treatment of the early Germanic and Icelandic world by Hilda Davidson, and the sceptical classical world, by J. S. Morrison, bring us nearer home. This leaves China (Michael Loewe) and Japan (Carmen Blacker), which have made their impact on the West with *I ching* and with geomancy, which coincides with a modern belief in lines of force that run below the surface of the earth, known as ley lines. Astrology also is still alive,

and the index shows in how many places it occurs.

The book is excellently produced, but the price is likely to confine it to libraries.

Bristol

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

## JERUSALEM HENRY CATTAN

Croom Helm 1981 229pp. £12.50

ISBN 0 7099 0412 6

All sides in the debate about Palestine—from Begin to Sadat to Arafat—have agreed that the fate of Jerusalem lies at the heart of any lasting solution to the Middle-East problem. Henry Cattan's book is a compelling and poignant review of the history of this city. It begins with the veracity of Israel's biblical claim to prior residency in the land (although he fails to deal with the theological notion of *promise*) and concludes with a careful study of Jerusalem's political sufferings since the British Mandate after World War I. This later period, especially since 1948, comprises the bulk of the book, for which the author is eminently qualified. Cattan, a longtime resident of Palestine, is a professor of law in Jerusalem and appeared at the United Nations in 1947 and 1948 on behalf of the Palestinian Arabs.

The major strength of the work is that it is not *merely* passionate. Cattan's earlier study on *Palestine and International Law* (London, 1976) is reflected here in that the present volume is a sober, meticulously researched political analysis supported by countless references to United Nations decisions (recorded in 65 pages of appendices). *Jerusalem* is the story of Israel's gradual acquisition of this city, which he terms its 'Judaization'. He points to the forced expulsion of its Arab residents and the rapid occupation of their homes by Israeli settlers in both the modern city (1948) and in Old Jerusalem (1967). This brought about major demographic changes. For example, from 1947 to today, greater Jerusalem's Arab population has shifted from 105,540 to 75,000, while the Jewish population has grown from 99,690 to 275,000.

Since the nineteenth century, a principle of international law, affirmed both by the League of Nations and by the Charter of the United Nations, has been that in war the occupier possesses only a *de facto* power, and his conquest does not displace the sovereignty of the conquered. Cattan effectively shows that Israel's annexation of Jerusalem has been repeatedly condemned under this rule by the UN (pp. 121-26), and this indefensible position forms the centre of his legal argument. But this fact—along with the fact that Israel has flouted 260 such UN resolutions—is a matter of record. The question today is how we can amend the present situation and secure a solution for the future. Cattan rightly blames American foreign policies (pp. 137ff.), which have not sided with the UN majority (notice Carter's flipflop in March, 1980) and thereby encouraged Israeli expansion into the occupied lands. The future, then, still rests in American hands.

Cattan's solution for Jerusalem is based on the original UN suggestion of 1947 of creating an international, unified city ruled by a Tripartite Council (Jews, Christians, Muslims). This means Israel's withdrawal from *all* Jerusalem (modern and old) and the return of its displaced refugees, most of whom originally lived in the modern section. But is this kind of intransigence the way forward? Realistically, modern Jerusalem has been occupied *and developed* for thirty-five years, and Israel will not give up this foothold. Some concessions must be made by both sides.

Henry Cattan's presentation of the Palestinian case for Jerusalem should become a model for Arab debate in the West. It is a clear-headed and persuasive testimony based on thorough documentation and concise legal argument. To discover a lasting justice in the current Middle-East crisis, voices such as his must be considered seriously.

The University of Aberdeen

GARY M. BURGE

**THE UNKNOWN CHRIST OF HINDUISM: Towards an Ecumenical Christophany** RAIMUNDO PANIKKAR

*first published 1964*

*Darton, Longman and Todd 1981 195pp. £5.95*

ISBN 0 232 51496 8

This is a second, revised and enlarged edition of a book first published in 1964. Then it was described as 'notable', 'controversial', and 'original', but also as 'an obscure and difficult book'. It is all of these things but more—a 'must' for anybody engaged in dialogue with people of other faiths or in the contextualization of theology. It comes from the stable of Roman Catholic theologians who, leading up to and since Vatican II, have begun to explore the relationship between Christianity and other religions with considerable vigour but also at times with a surprising ignorance of work previously done by Protestants in the field.

The author, Raimundo Panikkar, is yet another in the line of distinguished Indian contributors to this subject. Born in Barcelona in 1918, the son of a Hindu father and a Spanish Roman Catholic mother, he was brought up in a Hindu-Christian environment. He was ordained priest in 1946 and subsequently taught in the Universities of Mysore, Varanasi, Harvard and California, at Santa Barbara, where he is currently professor of comparative philosophy and history of religions. His great concern is that Hindu philosophy should find a place in the Christian tradition similar to that achieved by Greek philosophy in the early church and mediaeval Europe. Consequently, his attempt to integrate Indian and Christian thought has been compared with Aquinas' incorporation of Aristotle's philosophical method into Christian theology—to quote Panikkar himself: 'I would like to reiterate that in my opinion the "discovery" of a Saṅkara or a Rāmānuja is just as important for Christian theology today as the assimilation of Plato and Aristotle was in ages past' (p.167).

Allowing three principles to guide him, the author has endeavoured in this new edition: 1) to make explicit what was written too cryptically in the first; 2) to keep from the first edition all that he still believes can truly be said; and 3) to refrain from changing the text completely according to his present vision (that, he says, would have meant writing a new book). He appears to achieve his objective by means of a new preface, an extended introduction, an expanded set of footnotes and a somewhat fuller text. Otherwise the book is substantially as before, dividing itself into three chapters: on the existential encounter between Hinduism and Christianity, the doctrinal relationship between Hinduism and Christianity, and a paradigmatic discourse on the philosophical problem of God and the world based on one aphorism from the *Brahma-Sūtras* of the Vedāntic school of Indian philosophy, followed by a short epilogue.

Panikkar's is a cosmic vision. Not for him the old adage, *extra ecclesiam nulla salus*. God is at work in all religions. In his economy of salvation he leaves no people without the means of salvation. Christ is real and effective,

although hidden and unknown in other religions; in Hinduism, for example, Christ is present, but in a 'hidden' or 'veiled' way. The Christian commission is to 'bring Christ forth' in a way which will 'fulfil through conversion' the spiritual aspirations of men of other faiths or discover 'Christian' truth in other traditions.

Turning his attention even more specifically to Christianity and Hinduism, Panikkar finds that in the connection between God and the world there exists a functional correspondence between the role of Christ in Christian thought and Īśvara in Hindu thought. This may be best seen when Christians start, not with the historical Christ but rather with the Logos. It means that whereas it is true to say that 'Jesus is the Christ', it is not correspondingly true to say inversely that 'the Christ is Jesus.' It is at this point that I have greatest difficulty with Panikkar. Why the title 'Christ', when it appears to be emptied of all historical meaning and significance? Even the author himself recognizes the problem when he states: 'I might have spoken instead of the Logos or the Word, or of *śabda* or *vāc* or the like, or even of the Lord, which is somewhat better, culturally more neutral and thus more appropriately used in encounter. Yet if the word Christ has been used... it is... for the reason... that Christ is the name Christians use to express this reality' (p.164).

To conclude: despite the sophisticated and difficult nature of Panikkar's language and argument, I am inclined to agree with Eric Sharpe, who writes in his *Faith Meets Faith*, 'In the end, though, what Panikkar is saying in this book appears to be not greatly different from the "fulfilment" idea of the liberal Protestants more than half a century earlier', and Carl F. Hallencreutz who, in his *Dialogue and Community*, likens Panikkar's emphasis to that of 'the Christian Presence school of thought, particularly in Anglican missionary theology.'

Trinity College, Bristol

MYRTLE S. LANGLEY

## THE CHALLENGE OF MARXISM : A Christian Response KLAUS BOCKMUEHL

first published in Germany 1979

IVCF, USA and IVP, UK 1980 187pp. £1.95

ISBN 0 85110 417 7

After generations of either silence or a facile dismissal, evangelical thinkers in recent years have been trying to grapple with the challenge of Marxism to Christian faith and action.

Bockmuehl, a Swiss theologian/ethicist, now teaching at Regent College, Vancouver, has addressed himself systematically to this challenge.

After a chapter describing both the appeal of Marxism and its basic tenets, he looks at the specific reasons why Marxism continues to attract devotees to its view of life. Bockmuehl believes that its strongest claims relate to the discovery of the real, as opposed to an illusory, world and to its commitment to change illusion into reality.

In part II of the book, Bockmuehl examines Marx's specific attitude to the meaning and function of religion. He discusses how much of this critique is legitimate, and to what extent it is based on false premises. Part III deals with the place of ethical values in the thinking and strategy of both Marx and Lenin; part IV considers what, for Bockmuehl, is the key issue between Christianity and Marxism—the formation of a new man for a new society.

Although the book makes strong criticisms of the theoretical and practical failings of Marxism, it also allows Marxism to be a rigorous tool in taking

contemporary individualistic and other-worldly Christianity apart. Bockmuehl holds no brief for seeing in Marxism a doctrine that is false from beginning to end. His approach is to discover the 'log in the [Christian's] eye'. The book is not too technical. Young Christians (particularly students) who are likely to be in contact with Marxists would find the book at their level.

Though the book is useful (especially the section on the 'New Man'), I have to say that Bockmuehl is somewhat unreliable in his interpretation of Marxism on a number of scores.

Firstly, he does not discuss what to many Marxists is the essence of the whole theory, namely the specifically economic analysis of capitalism, and in particular Marx's theory of value and commodity exchange.

Secondly, he lays too much emphasis on Marx's earlier writings, rather than on the mature economic and political treatises. As a result he tends to treat Marxism more as a philosophical theory, which builds on and revises the thought of Hegel and Feuerbach. This, certainly, is part of his system; but in Marx's case it came to have less rather than more importance in later years. So the challenge of Marxist economics to social justice and economic life today is largely ignored. Consequently, Christians are let off too lightly. By the end we are congratulating ourselves that we have the answer to the failure of Marxism in spiritual regeneration. But what about our own failures?

Thirdly, flowing directly from this fundamental omission, Bockmuehl does not tell us how changed men are meant to change society, though in his healthy emphasis on the values of the kingdom he clearly believes society should be changed.

Finally, for these reasons and others, I think this book will not have a lot to say to Christians in the Third World who are looking more for practical than theoretical answers.

I think Bockmuehl has the ability to grapple with these dimensions to the Marxist challenge. Perhaps in a new edition he might address himself to these other issues as well.

St Paul's Church, Robert Adam Street, London W1

J. ANDREW KIRK

## **THE BREAKING PROCESS COLIN WINTER**

SCM Press 1981 117pp. £2.50

ISBN 0 334 00139 0

The thesis of this book is very simple: there is only one adequate definition of the true church in the modern world; it is the company of all those who struggle beside the poor for a new world where poverty will have ended.

The former Bishop of Namibia argues his case with great passion and quite uncompromisingly. He draws mainly on his own experience in Africa, and on stories he has heard from Latin America, and elsewhere, since his enforced exile in London.

He identifies himself wholly with the main theses of liberation theology. He does so, however, not as an abstract set of propositions, but with a real human touch. His subject matter is not primarily theology, but people—deeply suffering people.

Not that theory is lacking. There can be no tinkering, he believes, with the present economic and political alliances which continue to shore up a decrepit and discredited capitalist system. Socialism, somehow, must be established.

There is theology present as well. Bishop Winter sees the poor and op-

pressed as the redeemed of the Lord, innocent and sinned against. Their vices are due to the power of the system to subjugate their consciousness and to violate their integrity. The sins of the bourgeoisie, on the other hand—and they are many—are totally culpable. The church, to a very large measure, has partaken of the forbidden fruit of a system under God's wrath. Its only hope is to repent and return to its first love. Or, as the author prefers to phrase it, to be broken by coming out into the open in implacable opposition to the rich and influential who try to manipulate it for their own ends.

The book is well written. Its simple thesis is easily communicated. In many ways it is truly biblical and, therefore, needs to be heard. On the other hand, it is just too simple. Life for Colin Winter does not seem to hold complexities and ambiguities. Only one part of humanity seem to have been contaminated by sin. The other part, therefore, is free to work out its own process of redemption.

Both the testimony of Scripture and observation of life continue to warn us that resistance to the source of life and truth is endemic in the whole human race. Its manifestation is different according to circumstances. To ignore it in any way is to tread the path of disillusionment. Only fifty years ago, many were a long way down that road. Let not today's Christian follow his predecessor of the 1930s on the road to a speculative utopia. At the same time, let him name evil wherever he sees it, unafraid of the consequences.

St Paul's Church, Robert Adam Street, London W1

J. ANDREW KIRK

**IN PLACE OF WORK...THE SUFFICIENT SOCIETY :**  
A Study of Technology from the Point of View of People  
DAVID BLEAKLEY

SCM Press 1981 119pp. £3.95

ISBN 0 334 00691 0

At the end of Brecht's great play *The Life of Galileo*, Galileo says: 'If scientists are scared off by dictators and content themselves with piling up knowledge for knowledge's sake, science will be crippled and your new machines will only mean new hardships.... The gulf between you and the people will become so great that one day you will cry out in jubilation over a new achievement—and be greeted by a cry of universal horror.'

That universal theme is the overarching symbol of David Bleakley's book. He explores the impact of microtechnology on the lives of human beings and the relationship of the Christian church to that problem (p.110).

He argues that we need a new vision of ourselves to understand how Britain can move with new direction and hope within the international community. Part of the meaning of salvation is to be stripped of our corporate illusions and our self-preoccupied myopia. Because both our social and economic assumptions are undergoing a transformation, we need a shift in perception almost equal to that which took place at the time of Copernicus and Galileo. Beneath the surface of our economic and political life, things will never be the same again because of the transformation being wrought by micro-technology (p.210).

David Bleakley explores the ethical and political questions raised by the new technology, but his overriding concern is about its impact on human beings. He develops a number of positive ideas about alternative strategies for work and employment, including the notion of the social wage and a



greater degree of work-sharing. He also recognizes how urgent is the need for new educational strategies to sustain that change (p.278).

I had one major question. Where was the motivation to come from, for this world beyond tomorrow? The outer transformation of the world needs to be matched by a transformation within man's interior world (p.314).

Southwark, London

ROBIN GREEN

## IT IS NOT LAWFUL FOR ME TO FIGHT JEAN-MICHEL HORNUS

translated A. KREIDER & O. COBURN

first published in Switzerland 1960

Herald Press, USA and Canada 1980

Paternoster Press 1980 370pp. £7.80

ISBN 0 8361 19118

Students of the early church, and those interested in Christian attitudes towards warfare and the state, will be fascinated by J. M. Hornus' book, now at last available in an English translation revised and reworked by Dr Alan Kreider of the London Mennonite Centre.

In a series of fact-studded chapters, M. Hornus gives us the benefits of his wide reading and research into the social history of early Christianity. He shows the many-sided approach which Roman Christians adopted towards the state and military machine which persecuted them with such little cause. He collates and presents in very readable fashion the evidence we have for Christian soldiers and military saints, although he is careful to emphasize that true sanctity involved the abandonment of such an ungodly profession.

Hornus' thesis is that the persecuted church was officially antimilitarist, and that this attitude underwent a radical change under the combined influence of Constantine and Eusebius. To students of the postwar Continental scene in theology, this argument will sound familiar: it is now all too fashionable to speak of the 'post-Constantinian era' and repudiate those centuries of Christian experience when church and state supposedly worked hand-in-glove to build the New Jerusalem in Western Europe.

Unfortunately, as with all such theses, M. Hornus' argument suffers from its oversimplicity. Medieval Christendom was not particularly warlike, and a good deal of the legislation about the 'just war' came about in order to prevent anarchy and establish as much peace as possible. Likewise, antimilitarism in early Christianity can easily be seen as a relapse into an other-worldliness which has only superficial support from the NT. The same people who advocated pacifism also advocated rigorous celibacy, though Hornus does not include that in his programme for the modern church! In the end, however, we are forced to the same conclusion: like celibacy, pacifism shows an attractive nobility of spirit which is admirable in individuals but would be disastrous if it were ever applied to society at large. If it is wrong to build the kingdom of God on earth by secular means like warfare, it is just as wrong to pretend that we can live in it before the *parousia*. Here, then, is a book which will stimulate, but not resolve arguments about the eternal tension between the Christian and the world he is called to live and witness in.

Oak Hill College, London

GERALD BRAY

**LIVING MORE SIMPLY** edited RONALD J. SIDER

IVCF, USA 1980

Hodder and Stoughton 1980 206pp. £1.50

ISBN 0 340 25887 X

Are you committed to a simple life-style? This book helps first by correcting your motivation: what matters is commitment to Jesus and his kingdom. Biblical principles precede practical models in the development of a Christian mind on life-style and in these pages. Plough through the first chapter's jargon-call to simpler life-style, and you reach two chapters on biblical foundations for living more simply. 'Our fault has been, and still is, an un-biblical selectivity in the preaching, reading and application of the Word of God.' Six categories of relevant OT teaching are considered. Then, from a widely-annotated survey of the basic NT ethical perspective (Christ-centred, eschatological, charismatic and communal), seven suggestive theses emerge on biblical life-style, concluding that 'it is not a life-style of must' but of 'celebration ... as the freedom of the Spirit.'

There follow three chapters of guidelines and models for 'Struggling Free in the Family' (eight examples), in the church (nine examples), and in professional life (three testimonies). The last is least useful, partly because of the book's American origin in the preparations for the March 1980 International Consultation on Simple Life-style, which asked how this part of the 1974 Lausanne Covenant could work: 'Those of us who live in affluent circumstances accept our duty to develop a simple life-style in order to contribute generously to both relief and evangelism.' The detailed family and church experiences—related humbly—suggest that such attempts also bring new freedom and satisfaction, while warning that simple life-style must not become a new legalistic cult. In supporting each other, Christians can serve their local area more sacrificially. These church experiments mostly do not mention denominational structures; your parish must relate its new life-style to its old diocesan quota. A final chapter points us in the direction of the Brandt Report. The book is not too American to get us thinking, experimenting, and asking: Who and where are the writers of a comparable UK resources and ideas aid?

Wycliffe Hall, Oxford

GORDON OGILVIE

**THE GIFT OF FEELING**

PAUL TOURNIER translated EDWIN HUDSON

first published in France and Switzerland 1979

SCM Press 1981 137pp. £3.50

ISBN 0 334 02023 9

'The great philosophers are men, the great peelers of potatoes are women', says Madame Bernheim. Paul Tournier uses these two concepts as the platform from which he makes his plea that women have a 'mission in life'. The last few centuries have been dominated by 'the masculine principle'. Now it is time for the feminine principle to fertilize and generate a greater degree of balance and harmony in western culture. Men are more comfortable with ideas, theories, external objects, science and reason, and have in the past regarded women's sensibilities and emotions as inferior. Women are more concerned with people, relationships, emotions, sensibility and their inner being.

Women are prepared to devote themselves to a man they admire—as wife or secretary—and men have frequently, without realizing it, exploited this.

At the same time women often encourage this exploitation without realizing it. A woman never works for some *thing* but always for some *one*. Both these factors have given birth to the feminist movement, but the idea that academic study, career and equality establishes the value of a woman is essentially a masculine concept. Many feminists are losing their femininity as they try to establish it, because of this fundamental misunderstanding. The 'mission' of woman is to put man into touch with his inner feelings, not simply to peel his potatoes. Tournier is pleading for a genuine dialogue at every level between the masculine (power) and the feminine (person). Power without relatedness produces inhumanity. Men must have the courage to acknowledge the 'irrationality' of women's sensitivity and to accept it as valid. Both must be open to the other on equal terms, in spite of the discomfort that it may cause. This would have ramifications in personal, industrial and political scenes, and bring about a fundamental change in society. He presents his thesis in the wide-ranging and discursive style familiar to Tournier readers. Much of his thinking rests upon the work of his compatriot C. G. Jung, but he is saying something which is essentially scriptural truth. It is a subject which bears closer scrutiny than Tournier seems to give it: at times I felt his attitude was somewhat paternalistic, and that half an hour after it had begun, he was woken up to the fact that an important event is in progress. However, Tournier is restating issues which are still far from resolved, and the whole subject of human sexuality leaves room for much serious thought.

Care and Counsel, London EC4

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

## **THE PAIN THAT HEALS : The Place of Suffering in the Growth of the Person** MARTIN ISRAEL

*Hodder and Stoughton 1981 192pp. £4.95*

ISBN 0 340 26411 X

Many times I have said to myself that ultimately there is only one question in life which has any significance. Beside it, all the others are more or less trivial. That question is 'What do we do with pain?'

Here, Martin Israel discusses the meaning of suffering from different aspects: the 'encounter with psychic despair' when we get in touch with our own inner dereliction (our own private Gethsemane); the impotence inflicted by a malfunctioning body or by ageing; the appalling injustice and suffering in society and the world at large; vicarious and redemptive suffering and the significance of healing. As the subtitle of the book implies, Dr Israel's point is that suffering is essential to the spiritual growth and refinement of any person, and that 'only the man who has emerged from the dark pit of suffering is able to live no more in himself but in God' (p.110). Most people live in the shallow equilibrium of waking consciousness, until they are suddenly jolted by something uncomfortable into a new level of awareness. At this point, many try to avoid pain by 'healing' or diversions of one sort or another, but Dr Israel maintains that healing and growth are the outcome of suffering that has achieved its refining purpose.

This is a stimulating and challenging book, whose intention is obviously to spur readers on to a life of much deeper relatedness to God. The author

draws heavily on biblical insights into pain in the divine economy (and the life of the Lord Jesus). He also uses his intimate knowledge of Hindu and Buddhist traditions and of analytical psychology. Dr Israel seems to be an individualist in his theology but, nevertheless, he makes an interesting contribution to a level of understanding of life which many of us never achieve. 'As one grows in spirituality through the refining fires of suffering, so the ego is displaced from its customary dominance into its proper place of service on behalf of the whole person.' That sentence sounds so obvious, but the whole book elaborates the painful way in which it can be achieved. The book also seemed to me to have within it a sense of authenticity.

Care and Counsel, London EC4

MYRA CHAVE-JONES

**SOME THOUGHTS ON FAITH HEALING**  
VINCENT EDMUNDS and GORDON SCORER

*first published in 1956 and 1966*

*Christian Medical Fellowship 1979 102pp. £1.00 ISBN 0 85111 919 0*

**HEALING : Biblical, Medical and Pastoral**  
GORDON SCORER

*Christian Medical Fellowship 1980 31pp. 35p ISBN 0 85111 969 7*

The first of these is a thorough revision of a book originally published in 1956, whose topic has become increasingly relevant as interest in the church's ministry of healing grows. It is edited by two well-established Christian doctors, who are at pains to stress that they are enquiring into evidence for clear-cut healings of physical illness and make a definite distinction between this and the 'healing' of relationships, memories and the like.

The book opens with a review of the place of healing in Old and New Testaments, and then moves on to discuss differing views on the importance of the gift of healing in the church today. A chapter on 'faith healing' in history is followed by a description of the search of well-documented case histories of those who have been healed in recent years. A number of such cases are presented, but they are very few, and the authors conclude that the great majority of those helped at healing missions and centres of healing do not have organic medical disorders.

Although some may feel that rigorous scientific methods are inappropriate for the study of the activity of God, the editors' restrained and open-minded approach makes this a valuable counter to the ephemeral and over-enthusiastic writings which flood this field. Although primarily written for doctors the book is easy to read and is very good value at £1.

The second booklet presents much of the material in the earlier parts of the first book, but in a condensed form. The careful search for documented cases of healing is not included, so the booklet does not have the depth of the longer one. It presents a balanced discussion of the interplay of medical and pastoral skills, but for those wishing to grapple with the question of faith healing, the longer book is recommended.

Sevenoaks, Kent

A. C. BERRY

**PERFECT FOOLS : Folly for Christ's Sake in Catholic and Orthodox Spirituality** JOHN SAWARD

OUP 1980 247pp. £9.95

ISBN 0 19 213230 X

Here is a salutary reminder that a Christian is one who is united to a humiliated and crucified Christ. Human sinfulness causes the church and individual Christian to dodge the implications of this union all too often. John Saward reviews an aspect of the Christian tradition from the NT to modern times which starkly reminds the church of its calling to walk in the steps of the Crucified. His theme is 'holy folly', that exemplification in daily life of the pattern which St Paul describes in 1 Corinthians 4:9ff., where he writes about the vocation of an apostle: 'We are fools for Christ's sake... We are weak... We are in disgrace... To this day we go hungry and thirsty and in rags; we are roughly handled...' The examples are drawn from the Catholic West and the Orthodox East. We find among them the 'wild men' of early Christian Ireland, eleventh-century hermits, the Cistercians, St Ignatius Loyola, Jean-Joseph Serin, and, nearer to our own time, E. B. Pusey. In some cases the behaviour described is bizarre, to say the least. Occasionally real madness was the cause, but feigned madness was regarded by some as an acceptable device for expressing and drawing attention to the utter humility and selflessness of the Christian life. It is undoubtedly a moving story. I found it so, but I also found myself again and again wondering whether there is not a sharper distinction than Saward appears to draw between that suffering which comes upon a Christian *just because* he is seeking to live a Christ-like life in the midst of a sinful world, and that suffering which a Christian directly inflicts upon himself, believing that he is called to such a personal *askesis*. While admitting that some may well have a charism (as Saward puts it) for a life of severe asceticism, for the sake of the whole church, I find it hard to square some of the austerities which the book records with the *askesis* which the NT commends. But the book is very good as a reminder of what the Christian life is *in its essence*, namely, a following of the lowly, suffering Son of God.

Wheldrake Rectory, York

JOHN COCKERTON

**FREE TO LOVE : Poverty, Chastity, Obedience**  
FRANCIS J. MOLONEY SDB

Darton, Longman and Todd 1981 96pp. £2.95

ISBN 0 232 51518 2

In recent years there has been something of a turmoil in many religious orders as they have sought to come to terms with new demands and new ways of organizing their life. But the main subject of debate has been the *raison d'être* of their particular expression of Christian commitment. What are its biblical and theological credentials, and in what ways is it at one with the calling of that vast majority of Christians who live their lives in the ordinary, everyday world?

Father Moloney addresses himself to these questions by reconsidering the meaning of poverty, chastity and obedience. For him, these are not so much 'Evangelical Counsels' as 'Evangelical Imperatives' and they relate to all Christians. He unravels their contemporary significance by examining biblical texts and the pronouncements of Vatican II, and by trying to see them as means of giving shape and substance to 'the following of Christ as it is put

before us in the Gospel'. He doesn't delve into the many problems which historically have attended the theory and practice of the *Imitatio Christi*. He simply seeks to show that poverty is best conceived of as a loving sharing of what one has with others, chastity as giving first place in one's life to 'the overpowering presence' of the kingdom of God, and obedience as offering to God whole-hearted devotion after the pattern of Jesus himself. These, he argues, are imperatives for all Christians; 'religious' and 'non-religious' simply respond to them in different but *parallel* ways.

This is a thoughtful book, valuable not least for its critical attention to certain biblical texts which have traditionally been adduced in support of the 'religious life'.

Wheldrake Rectory, York

JOHN COCKERTON

## ALL THINGS IN CHRIST : Teilhard de Chardin's Spirituality ROBERT FARICY SJ

Collins Fount 1981 126pp. £2.50

ISBN 0 00 626351 8

This book is about Teilhard's teaching on spirituality, and his own spiritual experience. The two, as always, go hand in hand. Teilhard's general 'system', with its evolutionary and eschatological cast, attempts to bring together the worlds of science and theology. Whether it achieves its aim satisfactorily is a much disputed question. But one thing is clear (and this book helps to make it so): Teilhard's whole picture of the convergence of the world's life towards Christ-Omega is a thoroughly mystical vision, which has its roots in his own deeply-felt experience of God, going back to his earliest years. It is precisely this fact which has made some of his critics, scientific and other, so impatient with him. His language is often imprecise ('fuzzy' is Faricy's word for it) because it belongs to a realm of highly mystical experience where words are of limited usefulness.

Teilhard asked himself how the faith of the church might best be understood in terms of contemporary aspirations. Hence we find in his spiritual teaching a great many emphases which are perfectly familiar to us from the age-long tradition of the church—the centrality of Christ, the union of God and the world in him, the eschatological thrust of Christian faith, the unifying influence of love, and so on—all of them emphases which specially appealed to him because they articulated his own experience and gave theological depth to his understanding of reality; but (as it seems to me) they are pulled about and sometimes accommodated (to the point of distortion) to a framework of thought which is far removed at many points from the thought-structure of the Bible. It comes as no surprise, therefore, to find Faricy writing of Teilhard's 'near-pantheistic grasp of how all creation holds together in Jesus Christ', nor to discover Teilhard himself referring to what he called 'my personal tendencies towards pantheism' (pp.16 and 101).

I suspect that this will be a somewhat unrewarding book for those who are not on Teilhard's Catholic-mystical wavelength.

Wheldrake Rectory, York

JOHN COCKERTON

**FEARFULLY AND WONDERFULLY MADE : A Surgeon  
Looks at the Human and Spiritual Body  
PAUL BRAND and PHILIP YANCEY**

Hodder and Stoughton 1981 210pp. £1.75

ISBN 0 340 25955 8

**SHARING CHRISTIAN MINISTRY RONALD METCALFE**

Mowbrays 1981 113pp. £3.75

ISBN 0 264 66756 5

**PAUL'S IDEA OF COMMUNITY : The Early House  
Churches in their Historical Setting ROBERT BANKS**

Paternoster Press 1980 208pp. hardcover £7.60  
paperback £4.40

ISBN 0 85364 251 6

ISBN 0 85364 242 7

The idea of the church must be among the most highly debated and wide-ranging subjects of contemporary Christian debate. These three books indicate some of the great variety of perspectives from which the subject may be tackled.

In *Fearfully and Wonderfully Made*, Paul Brand and Philip Yancey give a fascinating account of good health and illness in the human body, and parallel descriptions of good health and illness in the body of Christ, the church. This provides a vivid development of the body of Christ motif in terms of the diseases of ordinary church life, and so opens up an exciting possibility for those who enjoy reading medical books to discover their own diseases, and theological books to discover their church's heresies! A thought-provoking book, good for a discussion group.

*Sharing Christian Ministry*, by Ronald Metcalfe, is an introduction to the theory and practice of non-professional lay ministry in the local congregation. It includes questions for group discussion, and three case studies of parishes in which ministry is shared. A useful book for the many conservative Anglican parishes which are only now beginning to think about shared ministry.

Robert Bank's *Paul's Idea of Community*, raises issues of fundamental importance for a theology of the church. It is an interesting and well-written account of the Pauline churches as communities. Their nature and style is compared with contemporary notions of community on the one hand, and with later ecclesiastical developments of church life on the other. The book is successfully midway between popular and technical in style, and is an attractive presentation of the relevant materials.

However, the use and interpretation of the evidence in this subject are matters of hot debate, and I cannot resist joining that debate by means of a few questions that arise from this book. Is it correct to claim that Paul's use of 'brethren' implies a small close community, in view of his use of it in Romans 9:1? Does the evidence suggest that the maximum membership of a 'church' was only thirty? Has the author done justice to Paul's role in maintaining his churches, and who was to continue Paul's job after his death? Has the author done justice to the significance of the pastorals? Is it not misleading to use the term 'house church' to describe Paul's communities, without acknowledging that the term 'house church' in the twentieth century includes different elements in its theological and sociological package? Even if ministry in Paul's churches did not concentrate on exegesis of the NT (because it did not yet exist), should it not play a large part in ministry today? Is the practice of Paul's communities definitive for those who live in a different theological and sociological setting? I am grateful to Robert Banks for stimulating these questions, and I look forward to his further writings on these important issues for the doctrine of the church.

St John's College, Durham

PETER ADAM

# Opinion

I read your latest issue of *Churchman* (1981:2) with considerable disappointment.

The article by Colin Brown on 'The Concept of "Evangelical"' made, no attempt to give a positive answer to the question 'What is an evangelical and in what way does he differ from other Christians?' Surely there are two things which must be emphasized: 1) an evangelical is a Christian who regards the preaching of the gospel as of supreme importance, and 2) historically, the word 'evangelical' has been applied to Christians who regard themselves and the whole church as at all times subject to the authority of the Bible.

I found the second article, 'Evangelicals and Anglican Liberal Theology', by Tim Gouldstone quite astonishing. That a sentence such as this—'When Christology is controlled by functional thinking, there is no logical necessity for an assertion of the uniqueness of Christ...'—could appear without any criticism of the shallow thinking involved, is quite remarkable! I cannot help noticing that the standard of scholarship apparent in this number of *Churchman* is not very high.

Dr Douglas Davies' article on 'Anglican Sectarianism'—a criticism of Bruce Reed's very inadequate description of the nature of religion—was slightly more encouraging but, oh dear, could we not have some articles revealing both good scholarship and *mature* Christian thinking?

Isleworth, Middlesex

(The Rev.) EDGAR DOWSE

## The general editor replies:

Thank you very much for your comment and criticism concerning the standard of scholarship in a recent edition of *Churchman*. It does seem fair, however, to point out that Dr Brown was undertaking a limited exercise—namely, seeking to establish that evangelical was a 'contested concept'. It is legitimate to argue against this thesis, but less so to blame Colin Brown for not answering questions which do not immediately relate to it.

I am afraid that Mr Dowse has misunderstood Mr Gouldstone. In the sentence which he cites, Mr Gouldstone was summarizing the consequences of a particular viewpoint and not identifying himself with it. In fact the application of a functional view to Christology was criticized in the immediately preceding pages.



I am concerned about the role and needs of retired people within the life of the church. Ministers and full-time church workers are the leaders, and therefore I hope to investigate the quality and extent of the preparation they receive for this area of work during their training.

I would be interested in hearing the views of retired people on a) how they feel the church could use their contribution more effectively, and b) the needs they have which they wish ministers and church members would meet.

I would also like to hear from ministers and full-time church workers (both working and retired) on what training and help they feel would enable the church to be more effective in their ministry to this age group.

6 Hillfield Avenue, London N8

ANN WEBBER

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

**Allen and Unwin** *The Mystical 'I'*, J. S. Goldsmith, £2.50, 1981; *Living the Infinite Way*, J. S. Goldsmith, £2.50, 1981; *What is Sufism?*, M. Lings, £2.50, 1981; *You and Your Handicapped Child*, A. Purser, £4.95, 1981

**Almond Press** *Images of Man and God: Old Testament Short Stories in Literary Focus*, ed. B. O. Long, £5.95(pb) £14.95(hc), 1981

**Arthur James** *Miracles in Sin City*, H. Cooper & D. Wooding, £1.95, 1981; *Love: The Word that Heals*, D. Duncan, £3.95, 1981

**Carey Publications** *The Gospel of Violence*, D. Kingdon, 50p, 1981; *Which Version Now?* B. Sheehan, 80p, 1981

**Collins** *I Believe Here and Now*, R. Snowden, £1.25, 1981; *Christian Reflections*, C. S. Lewis (ed. W. Hooper), £1.50, 1981

**Cowley Publications** *The Traces of God in a Frequently Hostile World*, D. Allen, US\$5.00, 1981

**Darton, Longman and Todd** *The Marks of the Cross: The Story of Ethel Chapman and the Stigmata*, T. Harrison, £2.25, 1981; *Only One Way Up*, K. Gibbs, £3.95, 1981; *A Thousand Reasons for Living*, H. Camara, £2.25, 1981

**Geoffrey Chapman** *The Papal Year*, P. Hebblethwaite, £4.95, 1981

**Grove Books** *The Wisdom to Listen*, M. Mitton, 60p, 1981; *Leading Worship*, C. Buchanan, 60p, 1981; *Ceremonial in Worship*, T. Lloyd, 60p, 1981; *Preaching at Weddings*, I. Bunting, 60p, 1981

**Hodder and Stoughton** *Padre in Colditz: The Diary of J. Ellison Platt MBE*, ed. M. Duggan, £1.95, 1980; *God's Smuggler to China*, Brother Andrew, D. Wooding & S. Bruce, £1.50, 1981

**IVP** *Let the Bible Speak*, J. F. Balchin, £1.25, 1981

**Lion Publishing** *Inside Iran*, P. Hunt, £1.50, 1981; *The Lion Children's Bible: Stories from the Old and New Testaments*, P. Alexander, £4.95(hc), 1981; *The Roman Empire*, E. Yamanchi, £1.25, 1981; *Introducing the Bible*, G. Hughes & S. Travis, £5.95, 1981

**Mowbrays** *A Theology of Generosity: Principles and Practice of Giving Based on Bible Teaching*, W. W. Badger Berrie, £1.25, 1981; *The Wonder of Love*, Brother Roger, £1.50, 1981

**Paternoster Press** *Green Finger of God*, M. Sinclair, £2.60, 1980; *Herod Antipas: A Contemporary of Jesus Christ*, H. W. Hoehner, £6.50, 1980; *Paul: Apostle of the Free Spirit*, F. F. Bruce, £8.00, 1977

**Penguin** (with Lion Publishing) *The Puffin Children's Bible: Stories from the Old and New Testaments*, P. Alexander, £2.50(pb), 1981

**Pickering and Inglis** *Lonely But Never Alone*, N. Cruz & M. Harris, £1.60, 1981

**Saint Andrew Press** *The New Beginning: Studies in the Fourth Gospel*, W. G. Morrice, £1.75, 1981; *Thine Own Secret Stair: Suggestions for a Month's Private Prayer*, E. G. K. Hewat, 95p, 1981

**SCM Press** *Religion and Theology 6: A Select Book Guide*, ed. SCM Press, £1.60, 1981

## INDEX OF REVIEWS

BALADO, <i>The Story of Taizé</i> , (J. Cockerton)	364
BANKS, <i>Paul's Idea of Community</i> , (P. Adam)	377
BARROW, <i>The Flesh is Weak</i> , (J. D. Douglas)	363
BARTH, <i>Evangelical Theology</i> , (A. L. Moore)	354
BEKER, <i>Paul the Apostle</i> , (A. T. Lincoln)	353
BEST, <i>Following Jesus</i> , (J. Wenham)	348
BLEAKLEY, <i>In Place of Work... the Sufficient Society</i> , (R. Green)	370
BOCKMUEHL, <i>The Challenge of Marxism</i> , (J. A. Kirk)	368
BRAND, YANCEY, <i>Fearfully and Wonderfully Made</i> , (P. Adam)	377
BRIDGE, PHYERS, <i>The Meal that Unites?</i> (N. Sagovsky)	358
BRUCE, <i>1 and 2 Corinthians</i> , (S. Smalley)	351
CARROLL, <i>From Chaos to Covenant</i> , (P. Budd)	344
CATTAN, <i>Jerusalem</i> , (G. M. Burge)	366
CLEMENTS, <i>Isaiah 1-39</i> , (A. Motyer)	343
COGGAN, <i>Sure Foundation</i> , (M. Stockwood)	355
CROWE, <i>The Lonergeran Enterprise</i> , (P. Adam)	365
EDMUNDS, SCORER, <i>Some Thoughts on Faith Healing</i> , (A. C. Berry)	374
EDWARDS, <i>Christian England</i> , (A. Rogers)	359
FARICY, <i>All Things in Christ</i> , (J. Cockerton)	376
FARMER, <i>The Synoptic Problem</i> , (J. Wenham)	347
FRANCE, WENHAM (eds.), <i>Gospel Perspectives</i> , (S. Smalley)	346
GORNALL (ed.), <i>The Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman</i> , Vol. 5, (J. Pollock)	361
HAMILTON, <i>The Family of Love</i> , (J. Atkinson)	360
HENDRIKSEN, <i>Romans 1-8</i> , Vol. 1, (P. Pytches)	350
HORNUS, <i>It is Not Lawful for Me to Fight</i> , (G. Bray)	371
HYATT, <i>Exodus</i> , (J. Baldwin)	342
ISRAEL, <i>The Pain that Heals</i> , (M. Chave-Jones)	373
KER, GORNALL (eds.), <i>The Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman</i> , Vol. 4, (J. Pollock)	381
LAMPE, <i>Explorations in Theology 8</i> , (R. Higginson)	357
LÉON-DUFOUR, <i>Dictionary of the New Testament</i> , (D. Wheaton)	345
LIVINGSTONE (ed.), <i>Studia Biblica 1978</i> , (S. Motyer)	352
LOWE, BLACKER (eds.), <i>Divination and Oracles</i> , (S. Wright)	365
MARTIN, <i>Philippians</i> , (S. Smalley)	351
METCALF, <i>Sharing Christian Ministry</i> , (P. Adam)	377
MOLONEY, <i>Free to Love</i> , (J. Cockerton)	375
PACKER, <i>Under God's Word</i> , (T. Thiselton)	340
PANIKKAR, <i>The Unknown Christ of Hinduism</i> , (M. Langley)	367
POLLOCK, <i>Amazing Grace</i> , (R. A. Leaver)	362
RAHNER, METZ, <i>The Courage to Pray</i> , (G. J. C. Marchant)	356
RAHNER, WEGER, <i>Our Christian Faith</i> , (G. J. C. Marchant)	356
ROGER, <i>Parable of Community</i> , (J. Cockerton)	364
ROGER, <i>Living Today for God</i> , (J. Cockerton)	364
ROGER, <i>A Life We Never Dared Hope For</i> , (J. Cockerton)	364
ROWLEY, <i>The Book of Job</i> , (D. Kidner)	343
SAWARD, <i>Perfect Fools</i> , (J. Cockerton)	375
SCHNACKENBURG, <i>The Gospel According to John</i> , Vol. 2, (S. Motyer)	349
SCORER, <i>Healing</i> , (A. C. Berry)	374