

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *Canadian Journal of Pentecostal-Charismatic Christianity* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_cjpc 01.php

BOOK REVIEWS

Thomas A. Robinson and Lanette D. Ruff, *Out of the Mouth of Babes*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012).

Out of the Mouth of Babes presents a curiosity of the early twentieth century: the spectacle of the girl evangelist. These were young girls, sometimes extremely young—as with Evangelist Beatrice Wells who was just four years old when her preaching career commenced—through the young teenage years and into the twenties. Robinson and Ruff consider these young female evangelists contextually as a Fundamentalist antithetical voice to the Progressivist flappers. The flappers spearheaded a sexual rebellion in the early 1920s that threw off the final vestiges of Victorian social strictures that were especially visited upon young women. “Hundreds, and perhaps thousands, of girl preachers stood behind pulpits—or on top of pianos if they were too short to be otherwise seen” (4).

Girl evangelists became the rage in the roaring twenties in an era known for unbridled experimentation and daring freedoms, but the evangelists outlasted the flapper fad by nearly a decade. “The youngsters were as traditional and modest as the flapper was unconventional and brazen—the most sharply contrasting exhibits of the feminine that the 1920s had to offer” (9). Two of the most famous girl preachers were Betty Weakland, whose preaching career began at age six, and Uldine Utley, who launched her national evangelistic campaign at age eleven. Although apt to scold against the loose morals of their time, these mostly Fundamentalist and often Pentecostal girls, together with the slightly older flappers, were also a part of the Hollywood child star rage. In fact, the authors considered the children (there were also boys as well) as a subspecies of child performers. The public stage was particularly receptive during this “age of the child star.” “In many ways, the child evangelist on a revivalist platform and the child actor on a Hollywood stage were part of the same performance” (7).

The authors investigate the phenomenon largely through newspaper clippings, while fully detailing the limitations of the medium. A

number of the most famous girls' lives are investigated in depth and compared to one another, as with the case of Utley and Weakland, who were presented both as comrades and rivals. The book also looks at just how these youngsters were able to rise to meet adult demands, or sometimes failed in their expectations, as in the case of Utley who suffered a mental breakdown and was hospitalized throughout the remainder of her adult life.

In explaining this curious phenomenon, the authors set the girls against the backdrop of the religious world in the Roaring Twenties, when American cultural storms collided publically and dramatically. "Clashing perspectives regarding sexual freedom and sexual restraint and conflicting positions over religious and scientific truth were part of the public discourse. These were not the only issues, but they were defining ones for the 1920s like no others, and these controversies had a lasting impact on the decades that followed" (151). Although oddities to us, these girls fit into their times. "The only really strange thing about girl evangelists was how a phenomenon so strange could be representative of a large part of American culture" (151). In a probing question not fully answered, the authors ask: "What was it that made something so potentially bizarre fit as a fully appropriate and understandable phenomenon of this era?" The authors offer a number of possibilities, ranging from the dramatic impact of Aimee Semple McPherson, who created a training program for young girl evangelists overseen by her budding evangelist daughter, to copycats, child stars, flappers, and the press. In this thoroughly entertaining and well-researched presentation of a shining era, this reviewer considers that the authors may have omitted a darker cloud that was forming on the horizon, one that would cast a shadow over the American culture for another several decades.

American culture was being shaped by a growing concern for hereditary and racial purity during this era, which may offer an additional layer of explanation for this complicated and curious phenomenon of child evangelists. It was an era when race-science was being institutionalized and widely taught, as is demonstrated by the fact that over 87 percent of the nation's textbooks archived at the National Institute of Education Library in Washington, D.C., included eugenics as a topic and more than 70 percent recommended eugenics as a legitimate sci-

ence.¹ Americans had begun focusing their attention on genetics, and specifically upon their own progeny. The preoccupation with all things pertaining to children—i.e., child stars, child evangelists, advertisements with children, etc.—may have reflected, at least to some extent, the need of Americans to reassure themselves of producing genetically acceptable offspring.

Out of the Mouth of Babes captures this fascinating era by presenting just a few of the possibly thousands of little girl preachers who stood behind pulpits, and most impressively were received and embraced by a nation as credible religious messengers who spoke into a cultural time like no other.

Reviewed by Margaret English de Alminana
Southeastern University

¹ Steven Seldon, *Inheriting Shame: The Story of Eugenics and Racism in America*, (New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University, 1999), 63-64.

James Robinson, *Pentecostal Origins: Early Pentecostalism in Ireland in the Context of the British Isles*, Studies in Evangelical History and Thought (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2011).

James Robinson's *Pentecostal Origins: Early Pentecostalism in Ireland in the Context of the British Isles* builds on earlier work on specific individuals and denominations to offer the first general account of its subject. Robinson writes with an acute awareness of the importance of his project. After reviewing the remarkable growth of the Pentecostal movement through the last century, he notes that "Pentecostal/Charismatic Christianity is advancing so rapidly that it is threatening to outpace its resources within scholarship, not least in its historians who in number are not commensurate with its march and are left puffing rather badly behind" (xxiv). Robinson's account offers a lively and accessible overview of the theological contexts for the emergence of Irish Pentecostalism and a detailed and engaging narrative of the Elim church from a sympathetic scholarly approach, which takes the claims of Irish Pentecostalism's leading actors at face value.

Robinson's *Pentecostal Origins* begins with the necessary backgrounds. The Pentecostal message was first popularised in England by A.A. Boddy, the vicar of All Saints, Sunderland. The Whitsun Conventions, which Boddy organized, became the principal vehicle for the circulation of Pentecostal ideas in England between 1908 and 1914. In its earliest days, the movement gained from the respectability associated with Boddy's position in the Church of England. But his position within an established denomination meant that Boddy could not offer the pastoral care required by those groups of Pentecostals who had formed themselves into discrete congregations outside the control of any overseeing body. In many ways, while having a "core interest in discovering the theological streams that fed the nascent Pentecostal movement" (xxv), Robinson's *Pentecostal Origins* is an explanation of the consequences of that vacuum in leadership.

It was from Sunderland that Pentecostal ideas reached Ireland. During the winter of 1907, Robert J. Kerr and Joseph H. Gray visited the English town and received their Spirit-baptism. Returning home to Belfast, they established "cottage meetings" and began to promulgate the new message. Of course, they had local advantages to draw upon. The evangelical revival of 1859, which had produced tens of thousands

of new converts, had precipitated the establishment of numerous mission halls through the landscape of the north-east of Ireland. These lay-led independent congregations were fertile ground for the growth of informal and sometimes eccentric theologies, including those of the Catholic Christian Apostolic Church in Zion, which promoted utopian communalism alongside strictly Levitical codes of purity. Even American-style camp meetings had their own tradition in Ireland. As early as 1862, such meetings were being convened in county Fermanagh, basking in the afterglow of the evangelical revival. Kerr and Gray were working in an environment, which was already predisposed to the informal lay-led character of the new faith.

Until 1913, the Pentecostal message did not make much impact outside a small number of assemblies established through the work of Kerr, Gray and their associates. It was with the arrival of the Welsh evangelist, George Jeffreys, in 1915, that the movement began its decisive period of expansion. Jeffreys was invited to lodge in Pine Street, Belfast (p. 88) – just a few doors down from the house in which my grandfather had recently been born – in which city he established a base from which to move into a series of successful missions in its rural hinterlands. He advanced the cause through the Elim Evangelistic Band, which he established, and which led missions throughout the northern half of the island. In 1918 the movement was brought under the authority of the Elim Pentecostal Alliance Council, and its drift towards denominational status accelerated.

It is with the detailed study of George Jeffreys in chapter 5 that Robinson's account comes into its own. *Pentecostal Origins*, for all its sympathy with the movement whose origins it describes, does refer to the less flattering aspects of Jeffreys' personality, including vanity, as expressed in his complaint that his name was not sufficiently prominent on the movement's new letterhead. This self-regard developed alongside his adoption of British-Israel theories, his early introduction of female pastors, sometimes with an aggressive pulpit style, and the "privation, bordering on destitution" which became "endemic" within the Evangelistic Band for which he was responsible (136). But it was Jeffreys' overpowering personality that led to his departure from the movement he had established. In 1940, the Irish Elim churches grappled with Jeffreys' changing views of the autonomy of the local church, realising the consequences of the system of personal control which Jeffreys had estab-

lished – for “in the system of checks and balances, the only person who was not answerable to another was Jeffreys himself” (182). Jeffreys was pushing for a centralisation of power that would allow local churches to be centrally governed.

However, Robinson’s account contextualises the history of Elim with the other influences on Irish Pentecostal origins. The book also describes the origin of the Apostolic Church, founded in Wales, which became the first serious challenger to the hegemony of the Elim Pentecostal churches in Ireland, and which advocated a much less restrained public worship, as well as allowing for extremely directive “prophesying,” with all of the dangerous pastoral abuses that might involve. Irish believers were also perplexed by the universalism that was being advocated within the movement by the former Baptist pastor, A.E. Saxby. Robinson documents a number of other extraordinary claims made by early Pentecostal believers, including that of a prospective missionary, who claimed to be able to write in unknown tongues. But even the admitted sympathy of Robinson’s approach cannot move beyond his sense that some of the claims of Aimee Semple were, at best, “implausible” (83).

Pentecostal Origins is an admirable exploration of a forgotten component of Irish ecclesiastical history and offers its rich resources to scholars and general readers alike.

Reviewed by Crawford Gribben
Queen’s University Belfast

Peter Althouse, *The Ideological Development of 'Power' in Early American Pentecostalism: An Historical, Theological, and Sociological Study* (New York: The Edward Mellen Press, 2010).

Peter Althouse, associate Professor of Theology at Southeastern University, Lakeland, Florida, has given us an excellent analysis of early North American Pentecostalism by drawing on three academic disciplines. His thesis is that “power,” to be understood in various ways – especially personal and social, is the key concept by which Pentecostalism should be understood. His main working discipline is sociology, but he also offers original historical material and provides a cogent theological discussion of nineteenth century developments. The book was originally part of a Master of Religion thesis for Wycliffe College at the University of Toronto, and there are traces of the academic process within the text, but it has been enlarged and revised to expand beyond the normal confines of a thesis. We have here something that puts in our hands a key – not the only key – to early Pentecostalism.

After discussion of Pentecostalism itself and of baptism in the Holy Spirit and methodology, the text moved to consider ideology and social interaction. Ideology is seen as being ‘rooted in cultural idea-systems within specific structures’ (40) whereas theology is ‘defined as a body of ideological cultural symbols that permit the social being to function effectively within a cultural system’ (42). Power itself, despite the difficulties of definition, may be seen, following Max Weber as ‘a *relational* entity that defines and enforces relationships between advantaged and disadvantaged or between a defined group or institution and the individual(s)’ (44). Power can therefore be expressed through structures and symbols but has both personal and social applications.

In the theological analysis of power going back to John Wesley and early revivalism, we gain an understanding of the debates over the emotional-experiential nature of encounters with the Spirit and the disputes over ways to achieve holiness, whether by more immediate or less immediate means. Phoebe Palmer enters the narrative, and we also encounter active holiness circles at the end of the 19th century. The rising currency of the term ‘baptism in the Holy Spirit’ shifts theological debate from one relating to ‘perfection’ or holiness to personal power. Within the Pentecostal experience itself, power is understood as being related to divine healing and charismata, although there is a paradox

over the affirmation of God's sovereignty that nevertheless enables a person to control his or her own destiny (101).

In the fourth chapter, there is analysis of sociological debate starting with Weber's now classic model for charisma. Early Pentecostalism is said to be identified by 'effective action' rather than 'rational action' and charismatic leaders demonstrate a charisma similar to Weber's prophetic type (137) quite different from the priestly charisma within sacramental traditions.

Alongside discussion of Weber is Emile Durkheim who, while he does not define charismatic religion, does speak of 'the collective' and the leader who is 'transformed into a sacred totem by the effervescence of the group' (139) yet, again paradoxically, the Pentecostal emphasis on a supernatural realm is 'one component in the process of secularisation' (145) because it presupposes 'the legitimacy of a natural order that excludes the divine' (145). This leads to a discussion of globalisation, and the work of Michael Wilkinson, who argues that globalisation means 'religion is a structured subsystem in the global sphere' (147) and that global flows occur through social networks so that 'Pentecostalism is a hybridisation of Wesleyan, revivalist and African religious rituals and symbols' (147). In any case following Weber, charismatic leadership has to be recognised by the community and attributed by the community to the leader. Thus there is an intimate connection between the leader and the group being led. Power in this respect is given not taken.

The final sections of the book deal with various aspects of empowerment including those related to organisation, race, the role of women, ecclesiastical fragmentation, and the social sphere and includes reference to the deprivation hypothesis, which is critiqued. This is a rich and varied book demonstrating a breadth of expertise and offering a path through the jungle of competing disciplines as they grapple with the monumental social-religious phenomenon that is Pentecostalism today. Future books might wish to take other key concepts and to subject them to similar multi-disciplinary analysis. Althouse is to be congratulated for creating a coherent and readable account that future scholars would do well to emulate.

Reviewed by William K. Kay
The University of Chester, UK

Mark J. Cartledge, *Testimony in the Spirit: Rescripting Ordinary Pentecostal Theology* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2010).

Mark Cartledge is Senior Lecturer in Pentecostal and Charismatic Theology and Director of the Centre for Pentecostal & Charismatic Studies at the University of Birmingham. His book *Testimony in the Spirit* is based on his investigation of the community of Hockley Pentecostal Church (HPC), which is part of the Assemblies of God of Britain and Ireland. HPC is a multi-cultural congregation with approximately 245 regular worshippers in the centre of Birmingham, England. Cartledge's background as a trained sociologist, researcher, and professor of theology enables him to provide a unique perspective. As a reflective practitioner in the field, his aim is to investigate "the contribution that ordinary discourse makes in the construction of a practical-theological account of Pentecostal identity."

The author gathered considerable data from his comprehensive ethnographic study of HPC completed over an eight-month period. He was a participant observer and facilitator of focus group discussions. The result is a concise investigation into the most salient issues with which Pentecostal congregations and theologians grapple: worship, conversion, baptism in the Spirit, healing, life and witness, world mission, and the second coming of Christ. All of this is impressively supported by a comprehensive and critical interaction with some of the most salient empirical research in the field. The bibliography alone is worth the purchase price of the book for those interested in the latest Pentecostal research concerning those subjects he addresses.

Cartledge organizes each chapter with a structure that mirrors the kind of dynamic interactions that practical theologians attempt to practice. He begins each chapter with a clear "thick" description of each topic, presents the most salient observations from congregant testimonies, provides a thorough historical review of the Pentecostal theological perspectives on the topic followed by what he calls "rescripting ordinary theology," and concludes with a summary of each chapter.

It is this process of rescripting the testimonies of the congregants that is both "critical in its analysis and constructive in its proposals" that is the heart of the book. For Cartledge, this rescripting process "seeks to maintain a tension between a revised script that is *both* in continuity with *and* in discontinuity with the existing script. It seeks to

move ordinary theology forward through a deeper analysis of its testimony mode and a broader dialogue with the Christian theological tradition, illuminated by the insights of the social sciences” (18). In other words, rescripting is a multi-layered process that takes the principles derived from a lived religion exemplified in personal testimonies through a dialectical process in which these principles critically interact with the denominational confessions and explicit theological doctrines - Assemblies of God in this case, to arrive at a “rescripted ordinary theology” for further implementation in the local church context.

The only thing lacking was an eventual assessment of how much of an impact this “rescripting of ordinary theology” actually had on the HPC congregation. Time and resource constraints no doubt limited that possibility for this book, but perhaps a follow-up completing the final step of evaluation of the approach would be in order in at some point.

As a result of his methodology, Cartledge has provided a provocative prototype of how practical theology can be done within the local congregation, especially in the gathering and analysis of qualitative data from participant observation and focus group discussions. In addition to his obvious skills as a sociologist, the author also provided two very helpful contributions to Pentecostal theologians. The way he defines and frames the issues within the local congregation will be used by many practical theologians for years to come, and, as mentioned before, the voluminous bibliography provides an impressive literature review of the latest Pentecostal scholarship on each of these issues.

In sum, Cartledge has put together a prodigious resource for Pentecostal scholars, students, church leaders, and all those interested in how practical theology can help in assessments and attempts to improve practices within both the academy and the congregation, and for that we should be thankful.

Reviewed by Brian M. Kelly
Southeastern University

Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Cosmology and Self in the Apostle Paul: The Material Spirit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).

Troels Engberg-Pedersen continues his quest to discern what can be known about the Apostle Paul's worldview. He argues that Paul's Jewish, apocalyptic worldview includes significant parts that are identifiably Stoic and that these Greco-Roman philosophical categories help explain how Paul develops a post-conversion sense of "self." In particular, what binds Paul's worldview together is the focus on the body and the materialist cosmology Paul shares with his Stoic contemporaries. Importantly, their shared cosmology has no category for immateriality—something that would not develop until the Middle Platonism of the second century AD. As such, when Paul speaks about the Spirit, he does not invoke a sense of something "immaterial," but of a concrete, material presence occupying the believer's material body.

Cosmology and Self is roughly divided into two parts. In chapters one through four, Engberg-Pedersen attempts to sketch the main features of Paul's cosmology by comparing Greco-Roman cosmologies (chiefly Stoic) contemporary with Paul. In chapters five and six, Engberg-Pederson draws on modern philosophers Bourdieu and Foucault to explore how Paul applies his worldview to his audience. In chapter one, Engberg-Pedersen founds his argument on how Paul's apocalyptic teaching on the resurrection in 1 Corinthians 15 relates with Stoic "scientific" cosmology and eschatology. In particular, Engberg-Pedersen here establishes that Paul's view of the Spirit is a materialist one, and that Pauline eschatology promises not the soul's escape from the body, but the body's ultimate transformation into spiritual substance.

In chapter two, the author argues that Paul's materialist view of the Spirit in eschatology extends to a materialist view of the Spirit in Paul's present. Exploring a range of Pauline texts, he argues that Paul shares substantial overlap with Stoic and, occasionally, Platonic cosmologies to understand God's Spirit as concrete and physicalist, dwelling in the concrete, physical bodies of believers. Further, such physicalism relates to the believer's cognition (the mind)—an important connection as Paul develops a sense of "self."

Chapter three focuses on a number of *topoi* relevant to Paul's materialist cosmology. In particular, Engberg-Pedersen here develops the connection between cognition, freedom, and self, and he considers

how Paul's personalistic language of the powers (angels, demons, and the "elements" [*stoicheia*]) relates to his materialist world-view. He identifies love as the emotional and cognitive side of the physical Spirit that will give believers ultimate victory over the physical powers now opposing them by finally transforming them – and the world – into substances of Spirit.

In chapter four, the author offers a detailed exposition of Epictetus, sketching Stoic concepts of freedom and self for humans and God. He attempts to show how Paul's teachings reflect a Stoic understanding of knowledge and freedom: one is free through true knowledge of one's world (including one's body) and true knowledge of God. He also shows how Paul's God is markedly different from the God of the Stoics, although the difference in the end is immaterial to their shared achievement of freedom through a proper knowledge of God and, derivatively, the world.

In chapters five and six, Engberg-Pedersen shifts away from establishing Paul's worldview to examine how Paul applies that worldview concretely. The shift also removes Engberg-Pedersen from the first-century to the present-day world of contemporary philosophy and sociology. Drawing on Bourdieu's concept of the "self" (the habitus), contemporary concepts of "religious experience," and Foucault's idea of "subjectification," in chapter five he attempts to show that Paul describes his sense of "self" with language that is bodily, and that Paul's letters extend his bodily sense of self beyond the individual to incorporate the social "bodies" of his communities into a shared sense of self. Binding all bodies together is the shared presence of the material Spirit.

Chapter six focuses on bodily practices within the Pauline communities. Engberg-Pedersen reiterates from *Paul and the Stoics* that Paul's ethics share patterns with Stoicism that explain the relation between Christ, self, and the shared world, but advances his argument by claiming that Paul's materialist cosmology underlies and reinforces Paul's language of cognition. Consequently, Paul's metaphors need also to be read concretely. In the end, Paul's own material experience of the Spirit becomes paradigmatic for the formation of Paul's communities, the Spirit (the Spirit inhabiting Paul himself) being transmitted through Paul's letters to them.

In the end, *Cosmology and Self* fails in its attempt to Stoicize Paul. Although he occasionally distinguishes Paul's apocalypticism from Stoi-

cism and offers infrequent caveats that “Paul was not a philosopher (and certainly not a Stoic)” (p. 6), his protestations are empty, for his overall argument depends upon great, and complex, commensurability between Paul and Stoicism that simply does not stand. The author’s indifference to details is what finally makes the book unpersuasive. Although he provides copious details from primary source texts in Paul, Epictetus, and other Greco-Roman authors, he fails to appreciate that those authors and Paul employ completely different languages in different contexts; they *demonstrate* almost no linguistic overlap in the concepts they discuss. Engberg-Pedersen arranges the material by identifying common “themes” broadly so that Paul’s mythical and apocalyptic language is forced to fit the complex and highly rationalized systems of Stoic science and philosophy.

Ultimately, *Cosmology and Self* is too idiosyncratic in approach and unsubstantiated in argument to be of much value, though it raises an important consideration for Pentecostals. Engberg-Pedersen's claim that “Spirit” is not immaterial but, in a first-century cosmology, must be something of *substance* does not originate with *Cosmology and Self*. This understanding was familiar within the History of Religions schools on Paul in the 19th and early 20th centuries and is demonstrable in rabbinic Judaism. The position was dismissed among New Testament scholars under Bultmann’s influence, who wanted to read Paul in such a way as to eschew “primitive Christianity.” Whatever the cause of its dismissal, here is an opportunity for Pentecostals to engage in fresh work on the Spirit that recognizes the Spirit’s very material presence in relation to the material bodies and world of believers.

Reviewed by Jeromey Q. Martini
Horizon College & Seminary

Lyman C. D. Kulathungam, *The Quest: Christ Amidst the Quest* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2012).

The Quest is Lyman Kulathungam's attempt to demonstrate that Jesus Christ is the unique answer to humanity's universal quest for salvation. Reminiscent of the approach adopted by Max Weber, and, more recently, Martin Riesebrodt, Kulathungam claims that all humans are on a quest for salvation. "Such a quest," he writes, "seems to be built into the very makeup of human personhood" (xiv). Kulathungam is very careful to describe Christ as being amidst, rather than a part of, this universal quest for salvation. The core of Kulathungam's argument hinges on the idea that Christ's ontologically unique status as God incarnate as described in the New Testament uniquely qualifies God to satisfy humanity's universal desire for salvation.

After a chapter describing humanity's shared quest for salvation and another explaining why Christ is uniquely suited to resolve this quest, Kulathungam spends eight chapters examining a number of world religions—Confucianism, Daoism, Shintoism, Buddhism, Hinduism, Sikhism, Islam, and Aboriginal spiritualities and the relevance that Christ has for the practitioners of these religious traditions.

Each of the eight chapters shares the same basic structure. It begins with a brief introduction to the particular tradition under examination and is followed by a discussion of the founders of the tradition, if any. Kulathungam then provides a survey of the most important textual sources of each tradition and a thorough discussion of those beliefs and practices that contain specifically salvific elements. Each chapter concludes with a consideration of how, according to Kulathungam, Christ is uniquely qualified to meet the underlying desire for salvation expressed within each tradition, a desire that he claims each tradition's own beliefs and practices are ultimately unable to satisfy. When discussing Buddhism, for instance, Kulathungam claims that Jesus Christ is better able to meet the supposed implicit salvific desires of Buddhists than is the Buddha because the Buddha's way of salvation is based on his own personal experience of enlightenment. However, Christ's way of salvation is not based on personal experience, but grounded in his deity.

The attempt to evaluate the religio-philosophical systems of the world religions according to the Christian idea that only through

Christ's ontologically unique personhood is salvation possible is the most controversial aspect of Kulathungam's proposal. A less controversial aspect is the idea that all religions and religious people are looking for salvation. Such criticisms, however, do not fundamentally challenge the integrity of Kulathungam's proposal given that he is admittedly working within a Christian theological framework.

Although Kulathungam's argument appears to be fairly conservative, the moving parts of his proposal are more sophisticated than many other contemporary systems, even if it provides the essentially same christocentric end result: salvation is only ultimately possible through the grace of Jesus Christ. For instance, Kulathungam develops a highly complex theory incorporating perspectives from the fields of ancient Greek mathematics, logic, and set-theory, intended to explain the ontological uniqueness of Christ and why this is necessary for the provision of salvation. Although a novel approach, the arguments will likely be unintelligible to readers without graduate training in philosophy.

What is likely to make Kulathungam's proposal shocking in the opinion of his more conservative coreligionists is his claim to approach all religions on an equal basis. He writes: "... one should not get entrapped with the parochial claim that there is truth only in Christianity and that all other religions are false—that the people of other religions have no knowledge about God or do not have any moral values" (12). It is difficult to imagine that the book will resonate with the more conservative Canadian Pentecostal base. The book's endorsement by the leadership of the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada, however, may be evidence that the traditionally hostile attitude towards non-Christian traditions among Canadian Pentecostals may be changing.

Kulathungam treats the religious traditions under his purview with a considerable degree of care and respect. However, despite his stated desire to avoid the tendency to "adopt a framework of analysis that takes Christ to be superior to those involved in the quest—that the claims of Christianity are true, while those of the other religious communities are all false" (6), Kulathungam does, at least implicitly, adopt such a perspective.

His biases are primarily evident in the facts that he grants the New Testament the unique status of special revelation and prioritizes the New Testament's explanation of what is capable of satisfying the

universal quest for salvation, namely, Jesus Christ. To be clear, these are presuppositions that scholars working within the Christian theological tradition need not be apologetic about. Such premises, however, make it difficult, if not impossible, to support the simultaneous claim that the author does not view Christ and Christianity as superior to other religious founders and traditions. Kulathungam's proposal is not necessarily incorrect, but one cannot claim to undertake a neutral examination of the religious quests for salvation in multiple religious traditions and at the same time privilege the position of one of these traditions.

The largest audience for Kulathungam's, *The Quest*, is perhaps his former students from Master's College and Seminary where Kulathungam taught philosophy and hermeneutics. His former students will likely see the book as an opportunity to reminisce about one of their most beloved and enigmatic professors. A number of readers within this audience will find *The Quest* challenging, but rewarding reading. However, despite the fact that Kulathungam wrote the book to explain to his former students how to relate Christ to the world religions, *The Quest* is probably too advanced for the majority of this audience.

The Quest is the culmination of Kulathungam's lifetime of contemplation on the theology of religions. His argument is fundamentally quite simple, but swaths of material spanning a variety of academic disciplines and most of the world's major religious traditions make this book most appropriate for advanced undergraduate and graduate students interested in the theology of religions and Christian approaches to religious diversity.

Reviewed by Adam Stewart
University of Waterloo

Candy Gunther Brown, ed. *Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).

Speculation and opinion thrive regarding both the roots and essential characteristics of the twentieth-century phenomena often known as the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements. Some propose that it is the “speaking in other tongues”—*glossolalia*—that is the *sine qua non* of these movements. More recently, others have suggested that an emphasis on disenfranchisement and the promise of material prosperity is at the heart of both the theology and popularity of these movements. *Global Pentecostalism and Charismatic Healing*, however, both asserts and demonstrates that the theology and, more importantly, the experience of divine healing outruns both glossolalia and prosperity as the primary factor responsible for the global spread, entrenchment, and popularity of these intimately related movements. Beyond simply being popular, noted scholar, Harvey Cox, who contributed the book’s “Foreword,” suggests that the impact of these two movements is too often underestimated. He asserts that rather than just being the most significant ecclesial event of the twentieth century, the influence of these two movements is even more basic and runs even further afield than did the sixteenth-century Reformation.

Edited by Candy Gunther Brown, (who also contributed three chapters), this work is a compilation of essays, each addressing a local and ecclesial manifestation of divine healing. Brown selected an internationally diverse cast of scholars for this project and, furthermore, she has drawn them from an almost equally wide range of disciplines—including anthropology, religion, history, sociology, and political science—resulting in both a global and an interdisciplinary feel and value to this work. After a couple of chapters that introduce readers to the impact and history of the divine healing movement, the chapters are subsequently grouped geographically by area. The book culminates in a section that explicitly examines the international network that comprises the Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing movements and, finally, offers suggestions for further research.

While the book examines the global healing movement, each chapter, almost without exception, focuses on a local expression of the phenomenon, identifying both its commonalities to the broader divine healing movement and its distinctiveness from it. The authors’ research,

like their resultant chapters, skilfully blends the use of statistical analyses, community narratives, sermons, personal testimonies, popular publications, and more. One of the benefits of such an approach is that the reader is shown the distinction between official ecclesiastical positions on divine healing and the beliefs and practices of local pastors, evangelists, healers, and lay people. The popularity of the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements, after all, is primarily grounded in the piety and the devotion of the laity and not in the theological utterances of ecclesial bodies. Having said that, however, it is also important to note that the examples provided come from beyond those churches or traditions that are often historically and denominationally understood to be Pentecostal, including mainline churches, independent congregations, and storefront ministries. All of these factors conspire to provide a divine healing movement that, as a movement, may defy precise description.

Undoubtedly, given an individual reader's approach, purposes, and predispositions, some chapters will be of greater appeal and of greater use than others. Those seeking to understand the expression of healing in a given culture or global area will, undoubtedly, be drawn to the chapters that discuss that particular situation. Consequently, such readers may find the chapters that address the global movement itself to be of less value. Others, seeking to understand the movement as a whole, may be drawn to those chapters that deal with the phenomenon as a whole and find the chapters that deal with specifics too precise and occasional to be of any lasting value. In spite of all that, I would assert that the greatest value of this text is found in viewing it, not as a collection of individual chapters on precise manifestations of divine healing or the impact of divine healing in particular regions, but as a whole, as a conversation among scholars from a variety of disciplines and a variety of regions, who discover common themes and comparing the distinct particularities of a global phenomenon.

While some readers might expect a concluding chapter that synthesizes the collected findings of the previous chapters, strictly speaking, none is provided. This, however, is to be expected, especially if one grants the individuality, uniqueness, variety, and legitimacy of the particular manifestations. As Brown implies in the "Afterword," while this text has provided great insight into a number areas, rather than caging this phenomenon and, consequently, answering all of the questions that

one may bring to it, it may have, instead, simply provided the occasion for further research. In addition, those who pick up this book hoping to discover a globally informed critically constructed, and conclusive doctrine of divine healing will be disappointed. This text makes almost no effort to engage or to critique the doctrine of divine healing *per se*. The reason for this may rest in the fact that there is no global orthodoxy on this subject, even within Pentecostal and Charismatic circles. Understandably, then, this text does not seek to propose one. In fact, there is no attempt to define what is understood to be “disease.” Descriptions of those situations from which “healing” is sought include the physical, mental, emotional, social, spiritual, and even the economic.

Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing is a timely and valuable contribution to broader field of Pentecostal scholarship and should be on the wish list of any student of the global Pentecostal and Charismatic movements.

Reviewed by Bernie A. Van De Walle
Ambrose University College and Seminary

Smith, Calvin L., ed. *Pentecostal Power: Expressions, Impact and Faith of Latin American Pentecostalism* (Leiden, Netherlands: Brill, 2010).

This edited collection of essays on Pentecostalism in Latin America is the sixth volume in the Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Studies (GPCS) series published by Brill. Overall, this book makes an excellent contribution to the study of global Pentecostalism and specifically the region of Latin America. Scholars interested in a current general survey of Latin American Pentecostalism that incorporates the previous literature into its analysis while raising important questions for future research should consult this volume.

The book is divided into three sections and consists of eleven chapters by recognized scholars in the field. An afterword by William Kay, general editor of the GPCS series, summarizes its findings and pulls together the various chapters. The first section is primarily historical and provides insight into the varieties of Pentecostals as represented across various countries. However, this section also works through current historical debates about the origins of Pentecostalism and what role North American Pentecostalism played in the development of Latin American Pentecostalism. Second, the essays in this section demonstrate that Latin American Pentecostalism is far more indigenous than many scholars assume. Third, the essays show how Latin American Pentecostalism is influential beyond its borders and is shaping the movement in North America.

The second section consists of four chapters that work through the theoretical debates about the relationship between Pentecostalism in Latin America and its social and political context. Bernice Martin writes two chapters in which she presents substantial background for the main theoretical issues. Martin's chapters offer an exceptional overview and critical analysis of those debates including the tensions between those who see Pentecostalism as an American export that interferes with the political aspirations of Latin Americans and those who view it as a more indigenous movement among Protestants and Roman Catholics that empowers them for social and political change. Martin moves the discussion forward by highlighting the tensions (indeed paradoxes) among Latin American Pentecostals and showing how old theoretical paradigms are inadequate for our understanding.

The third section consists of four chapters that explore the theological underpinnings of Latin American Pentecostalism, including the role of the Spirit in the lives and local congregations of Pentecostals, the relationship between Pentecostal theology and a Latin American image of God, the role of prayer and spiritual warfare, and finally, issues around ecumenical dialogue among Pentecostals and Roman Catholics. Together these chapters illustrate how Pentecostalism in Latin America is contextualized so that theological development has to be understood historically and theoretically. For example, detailed analysis of prayer, spiritual warfare, and the political implications of a theology of prayer in chapter ten by Martin Lindhardt show how theology shapes and is shaped by the daily lives of Latin Americans. In chapter eight, Calvin Smith illustrates how theological views have implications for social engagement. Finally, Cecil (Mel) Robeck's chapter the Roman Catholic-Pentecostal dialogue offers some hope for Christians in Latin America who desire to work together through a series of challenges and issues facing the churches.

Overall, this volume makes an excellent contribution to Pentecostal studies. Its focus on the region of Latin America offers scholars a solid overview of the literature. Yet, it is not simply a review of previous research. The book moves the study of Latin American Pentecostalism forward by engaging the literature and offering further insight into important questions about origins, local context, social and political issues, and the relationship between Pentecostal theology, church, and society. I highly recommend this book to researchers of global Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity.

Reviewed by Michael Wilkinson
Trinity Western University