

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *Theological Students Fellowship (TSF) Bulletin (US)* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_tsfbulletin-us.php



BULLETIN

THEOLOGICAL STUDENTS FELLOWSHIP

MAY-JUNE 1985

Vol. 8, No. 5

\$3.50

EDITORS

Mark Lau Branson
Thomas H. McAlpine

ADVISORY EDITORS

Clark H. Pinnock, McMaster Divinity College
Paul A. Mickey, Duke Divinity School

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Ray S. Anderson, *Systematic Theology*
Fuller Theological Seminary
Stephen T. Davis, *Philosophy*
Claremont McKenna College

Donald Dayton, *News Analysis*
Northern Baptist Theological Seminary

Roberta Hestenes, *Christian Formation*
Fuller Theological Seminary

Robert L. Hubbard, *Old Testament*
Denver Seminary

Stephen C. Mott, *Ethics*
Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary

Mark Noll, *Wheaton College*
Church History

Grant R. Osborne, *New Testament*
Trinity Evangelical Divinity School

David Lowes Watson, *Evangelism & Missions*
UMC Board of Discipleship

PERSPECTIVES EDITORS

Keith Bolton, Fuller Theological Seminary

Luis Cortes, Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary

Thomas F. Stransky, Mt. Paul Novitiate

Sze-kar Wan, Harvard University

FACULTY CONTRIBUTORS

Bernard Adeney, New College, Berkeley

Donald Bloesch, University of Dubuque Theological Seminary

Geoffrey W. Bromiley, Fuller Theological Seminary

Harvie M. Conn, Westminster Theological Seminary

Charles Ellenbaum, College of DuPage

Vernard Eller, University of LaVerne

Elouise Renich Fraser, Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary

David Gill, New College, Berkeley

Larry Hurtado, University of Manitoba

Susanne Johnson, Perkins School of Theology

Richard Mouw, Calvin College

Richard Lovelace, Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary

Pheme Perkins, Boston College

Bernard Ramm, American Baptist Seminary of the West

Gerald Sheppard, Union Theological Seminary

Charles R. Taber, Emmanuel School of Religion

Keith Yandell, University of Wisconsin

Anabaptist/Reformed Dialogue:
Reformed vs. Anabaptist Social Strategies:
An Inadequate Typology
John H. Yoder 2

Abandoning The Typology: A Reformed Assist
Richard Mouw 7

Qumran and The Hebrew Psalter
Gerald Wilson 10

The Missiological Implications of An
Epistemological Shift
Paul Hiebert 12

Karl Barth and Evangelicalism:
The Varieties of a Sibling Rivalry
Donald Dayton 18

The Decade in Pentecostal-Charismatic Literature
(1973-82): A Bibliographic Essay
Cecil Robeck, Jr. 23

NEWS STORY: Diversity Marks Wheaton Conference
Douglas Jacobsen 26

Book Reviews and Comments (Itemized on Back Cover) 26

Index: Volume 8 38

TSF Materials Order Form (center pages)

(May, 1954), 181.

² Charles C. Ryrie, *Neo-orthodoxy* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1956), p. 62.

³ Donald Bloesch, "A Reassessment of Karl Barth," chapter IV of *The Evangelical Renaissance* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1973), p. 81.

⁴ Cf. Colin Brown, "The Concept of 'Evangelical,'" *Churchman* 95 (1981), 104-9, and William J. Abraham, *The Coming Great Revival* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984).

⁵ This typology was first developed in "The Social and Political Conservatism of Modern American Evangelicalism," *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* 32 (Winter, 1977), 72-74, but also in "Whither Evangelicalism?" in Theodore Runyan (editor), *Sanctification and Liberation* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1981).

⁶ John McConnachie, "Reformation Issues Today," in F.W. Camfield (editor), *Reformation Old and New: A Tribute to Karl Barth* (London: Lutterworth Press, 1947), p. 103.

⁷ Eberhard Busch, *Karl Barth: His Life from Letters and Autobiographical Texts* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1976), p. 143.

⁸ Karl Barth, *Evangelical Theology: An Introduction* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1963), p. 5.

⁹ Eberhard Busch, *Karl Barth*, pp. 210-11.

¹⁰ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, pp. 527-8.

¹¹ Colin Brown, *Karl Barth and the Christian Message* (London: Tyndale Press, 1967), p. 139.

¹² This attitude is most fully evidenced in Donald Bloesch, *Jesus is Victor: Karl Barth's Doctrine*

of Salvation (Nashville: Abingdon, 1976).

¹³ P. 114 as translated by James D. Smart, *The Divided Mind of Modern Theology: Karl Barth and Rudolf Bultmann, 1908-1933* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1967), p. 85.

¹⁴ *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 741.

¹⁵ Reported by Eberhard Busch, *Karl Barth*, p. 447.

¹⁶ Eberhard Busch, *Karl Barth*, pp. 445-6.

¹⁷ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 683.

¹⁸ From Barth's foreword to Heinrich Heppe, *Reformed Dogmatics* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1950), pp. v-vi.

¹⁹ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 368.

²⁰ Cf. for example the work of Howard Loewen, of which there is an early report in Karl Barth's "Doctrine of Scripture," *Studia Biblica et Theologica* I (March, 1971), 33-49.

²¹ Cf. Fred H. Klooster, "Karl Barth's Doctrine of Jesus Christ," *Westminster Theological Journal* XXIV (May, 1962), 137-172; John Warwick Montgomery, "Karl Barth and Contemporary Theology of History," *Bulletin of the Evangelical Theology VIII* (Winter, 1965), 39-49; and the various writings of Cornelius van Til, especially those mentioned above.

²² Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 70.

²³ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 333.

²⁴ Karl Barth, *Church Dogmatics*, IV/1, p. 335.

²⁵ George Eldon Ladd, "The Resurrection and History," *Dialog* I (Autumn, 1962), 56.

CHURCH HISTORY

The Decade (1973-1982) in Pentecostal-Charismatic Literature: A Bibliographic Essay

by Cecil M. Robeck, Jr.

The past decade has seen a substantial increase in the number of books which have addressed issues related to the history, theology, and practices of charismatic renewal. This article, while by no means intending to provide a list of all such publications, is a short bibliographic essay outlining some of the more important books along these lines. They include studies undertaken by authors who represent a variety of theological positions. Some studies are clearly directed toward the subject of charismatic renewal while others are more obliquely related. It is hoped this essay will serve as a reference work for future use.

The present charismatic renewal's relationship to historic or classical Pentecostalism goes almost without saying. Much of its theology and practice has been greatly influenced by that of classical Pentecostalism. Several books have been published within the past decade which trace the origins of classical Pentecostalism, enabling us more fully to understand the relationship between it and the contemporary charismatic renewal.

Virtually all classical Pentecostal denominations around the world trace their origins to the Azusa Street Mission revival in Los Angeles, California, between 1906 and 1909. Two accounts written by first hand observers recently appeared. The first, Frank Bartleman's *Azusa Street* (Plainfield: Logos, 1980) is a reprint of his *How "Pentecost" Came to Los Angeles*, originally published in 1925. Long out of print and indeed quite rare, this diary of events appears in unabridged form edited by Pentecostal historian Vinson Synan who has provided an extended introduction which placed the book in its broader context. A.C. Valdez's *Fire on Azusa Street* (Costa Mesa: Gift Publications, 1980) provides a second eyewitness account of what went on at the mission during those important years.

The photographic reproduction of the first thirteen issues of "The Apostolic Faith" in Fred T. Corum's *Like As of Fire* (1981) provides a valuable resource on Azusa Street history. Published between September 1906 and May 1908 from the Azusa Street Mission, these papers, now available from the Gospel Publishing House in Springfield, Missouri, outline the influence of that mission, including sermons and articles by those in leadership at the mission, reports of worldwide revival and letters written from those who had passed through the mission during its formative years.

Joining Vinson Synan's authoritative study of American Pentecostalism, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Movement in the United States* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971), is social historian Robert Mapes Anderson's *Vision of the Disinherited: The Making of American Pentecostalism* (New York: Oxford Press, 1979). This is a skillful analysis of the tradition, tracing its history from reformed holiness roots, outlining key doctrines and providing a rare perspective on early leaders through the 1920s. David Edwin Harrell Jr. has chosen to

trace the history of healing and charismatic revivals in modern America in *All Things Are Possible* (Bloomington: Indiana University, 1975). He provides much data and traces connections between various healing revivalists who sometimes turned their disadvantages into opportunities for personal advantage while also ministering to multitudes.

Walter J. Hollenweger's worldwide survey *The Pentecostals: The Charismatic Movement in the Churches* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1972) has been particularized by a number of regional and Third World studies. Friendship Press of the World Council of Churches has reprinted Christian Lalive d'Épinay's *Haven of the Masses: A Study of the Pentecostal Movement in Chile* (1969). Cornelia Butler Flora has contributed *Pentecostalism in Colombia* (East Brunswick: Fairleigh Dickinson University, 1976), and G. C. Oosthuizen has given us *Pentecostal Penetration into the Indian Community in South Africa* (Durban, 1975). These volumes provide historical, theological, and sociological assessments. Anthropologist Stephen D. Glazier has edited a collection of anthropological case studies on Caribbean and Latin American Pentecostalism in *Perspectives on Pentecostalism* (Washington D.C.: University Press of America, 1980), while James E. Worsfold has given us an extensive *History of the Charismatic Movements in New Zealand* (Bradford, U.K.: Puritan Press, 1974).

Ethnic issues have not been ignored in this decade. The prolific Walter J. Hollenweger has offered his short *Pentecost between Black and White* (Belfast: Christian Journals Ltd., 1974) which deals, among other things, with Black and Hispanic manifestations of Pentecostalism. The late Victor de Leon has provided *The Silent Pentecostals* (privately published, 1979), a survey of American Hispanic Pentecostalism. He aimed to provide a biographical history of the Pentecostal movement among Hispanics, but dealt with the subject largely within the context of the Assemblies of God.

Three sociological studies, two of them dealing with ethnic issues, bear mention as well. The University of Pittsburgh Press has given us Melvin D. Williams's *Community in a Black Pentecostal Church* (1974), while the University of Massachusetts Press has recently published Arthur E. Paris's *Black Pentecostalism: Southern Religion in an Urban Setting* (1982). The third sociological study deals with neo-pentecostalism and the socioeconomic deprivation theory. It is Cecil David Bradfield's *Neo-Pentecostalism: A Sociological Assessment* (Washington D.C.: University Press of America, 1979). Two volumes appearing within the past decade are composed largely of papers originally given at meetings of the Society for Pentecostal Studies. Vinson Synan edited the historical *Aspects of Pentecostal-Charismatic Origins* (Plainfield: Logos, 1975) including articles by Martin Marty, Donald Dayton, Larry Christenson, Edward O'Connor and an array of Pentecostals. Russell P. Spittler edited *Perspectives on the New Pentecostalism* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1976), including studies by Walter Hollenweger, Clark Pinnoch, Kilian McDonnell, J. Rodman Williams, William Smarin, Donald Gelpi, Morton Kelsey and others. It provides historical, theological

Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., is director of student services and adjunct professor of historical theology at Fuller Theological Seminary. (This article reprinted from *Theology*, News and Notes, March 1983.)

and reflective articles relevant to the charismatic renewal.

Two other edited volumes are the result of denominational studies on the subject. The papers presented at the Fifth Oxford Institute on Methodist Theological Studies held in 1973 appear in Dow Kirkpatrick, ed., *The Holy Spirit* (Nashville: Tidings, 1974). Similarly, the papers presented in a series of Lutheran discussions held between 1974 and 1976 in a study project of the Division of Theological Studies of the Lutheran Council in the U.S.A. are available in Paul D. Opsahl, ed., *The Holy Spirit in the Life of the Church* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1978). A third edited volume of importance is Edward D. O'Connor, C.S.C., ed., *Perspectives on Charismatic Renewal* (South Bend: University of Notre Dame, 1975) which among other things provides a 40-page bibliography on "The Literature of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, 1967-1975." Michael P. Hamilton has edited a similarly helpful volume called *The Charismatic Movement* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1975), complete with a record of speaking in tongues, while J. Elmo Agrimson, president of the American Lutheran Church's Southeastern Minnesota District, edited *Gifts of the Spirit and the Body of Christ: Perspectives on the Charismatic Movement* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1974).

It is clear that classical Pentecostalism and the charismatic movement have spoken often of the importance of the Holy Spirit's presence and ministry in the church. A number of works written on the Spirit within the past decade warrant mention. George T. Montague, S.M., former editor of the "Catholic Biblical Quarterly," has offered a technically competent and instructive work called *The Holy Spirit: Growth of a Biblical Tradition* (New York: Paulist Press, 1976) in which he analyzes the principal canonical texts on the subject and shows how the people of God grew in their understanding of the Spirit. Building upon his important work on *Baptism in the Holy Spirit* (Naperville: Allenson and Philadelphia: Westminster, 1970), James D. G. Dunn has given us his sometimes controversial but equally stimulating *Jesus and the Spirit: A Study of the Religious and Charismatic Experience of Jesus and the First Christians as Reflected in the New Testament* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1976). Michael Green, editor of the "I Believe" series, has written the popular, balanced and practical *I Believe in the Holy Spirit* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1975). Classical Pentecostal Stanley M. Horton has given us his thoughts in *What the Bible Says about the Holy Spirit* (Springfield: Gospel Publishing House, 1979). Presbyterian charismatic J. Rodman Williams, professor of theology at the School of Biblical Studies, CBN University, has contributed yet another book on the subject titled, *The Gift of the Holy Spirit Today* (Plainfield: Logos, 1980).

Eduard Schweizer has produced a small but important work, *The Holy Spirit* (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1980), in which he analyzes the biblical evidence theologically and proceeds to address its implication in the life of the church. Edward Malatesta, S.J., edited *The Spirit of God in Christian Life* (New York: Paulist Press, 1977) dealing with issues of sanctification. Methodist Kenneth G. Greet's "Cato" lectures delivered at the last General Conference of Australasian Methodism prior to the formation of the Uniting Church of Australia, addressed the subjects of Pentecostalism and charismatic renewal in *When the Spirit Moves* (London: Epworth, 1975). Finally, the results of a symposium sponsored by the Institute for Theological Research, held at the University of South Africa in 1980 have appeared in W. S. Vorster, ed., *The Spirit in Biblical Perspective* (Pretoria: University of South Africa, 1980).

The subject of baptism in the Holy Spirit has remained more or less dormant since the works of Dale Bruner and James Dunn appeared in 1970—with two notable exceptions. Anthony A. Hoekema's two volumes on tongues (1966) and Spirit baptism (1972) have been re-issued in a single volume titled *Tongues and Spirit Baptism: A Biblical and Theological Evaluation* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1981). Charismatic Thomas A. Smail, editor of Britain's "Theological Renewal," has addressed the subject with some freshness in *Reflected Glory: The Spirit in Christ and Christians* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1975).

Gifts of the Spirit have received a great deal of attention, unfortunately not all of it helpful. Robert L. Thomas of Talbot Theological Seminary has provided a well written study of 1 Corinthians 12 through 14 from a modified dispensational perspective called *Understanding Spiritual Gifts* (Chicago: Moody, 1978). Ken-

neth Kinghorn of Asbury Theological Seminary and John Koenig of Union Theological Seminary have provided helpful works on gifts, the former giving us a popularized *Gifts of the Spirit* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1976), the latter providing a more substantial biblical theology, *Charismata: God's Gifts for God's People* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978). Roman Catholic Francis A. Sullivan, S.J., has written a short yet impressive work, *Charisms and Charismatic Renewal: A Biblical and Theological Study* (Ann Arbor: Servant, 1982), while Fuller professor C. Peter Wagner has attempted to link the subjects of spiritual gifts and church growth in *Your Spiritual Gifts Can Help Your Church Grow* (Glendale: Regal Books/Gospel Light, 1979). Finally, William J. Sneek has provided a scholarly phenomenological analysis of several gifts in his *Charismatic Spiritual Gifts* (Washington D.C.: University Press of America, 1981).

Specific gifts receiving treatment during the past decade are several. Healing and prophecy have received the most attention, but other studies need to be mentioned as well. On healing are Father Francis MacNutt's classics *Healing* (Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1974) and *The Power to Heal* (Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1977), the latter being available since 1979 as a Bantam paperback. These two works have received wide circulation within the Catholic charismatic renewal movement. Anglican Bishop Morris Maddocks has written *The Christian Healing Ministry* (London: SPCK, 1981), while classical Pentecostal Hugh Jeters links healing to the atonement in *By His Stripes: A Biblical Study on Divine Healing* (Springfield: Gospel Publishing House, 1977). InterVarsity has published the pastorally-oriented work of Roy Lawrence, *Christian Healing Rediscovered* (Downers Grove, 1980).

Morton T. Kelsey has produced an important work on the subject called *Healing and Christianity* (New York: Harper and Row, 1973) in which he surveys the history, theology and praxis of healing in the church. More recently, Klaus Seybold and Ulrich B. Mueller have provided a thoughtful biblical theology on the subject of *Sickness and Healing* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1981). Of particular interest to those involved in the integration of science and theology is physician John Wilkinson's *Health and Healing: Studies in New Testament Principles and Practice* (Edinburgh: Handsel, 1980). Finally, two books on inner healing which have found widespread use in charismatic renewal circles have been Ruth Carter Stapleton's *The Gift of Inner Healing* (Waco: Word, 1976) and John A. Sanford's *Healing and Wholeness* (New York: Paulist Press, 1972).

During the past decade, the gift of prophecy has received the most intense study of any of the gifts. No fewer than eight major monographs or books have been written in a variety of languages on this subject. The best available in English are: David Hill, *New Testament Prophecy* (Atlanta: John Knox, 1979), and the massive work of David Aune, *Prophecy and Early Christianity* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1983), which deals with every major prophetic oracle through the mid-Second Century. Those wishing to do more in-depth study of this gift will benefit from three other works in English: E. Earle Ellis, *Prophecy and Hermeneutic in Early Christianity* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1978) which also has much to say on words of wisdom and of knowledge; J. Panagopoulos, ed., *Prophetic Vocation in the New Testament and Today* (Leiden: Brill, 1977), and Trinity's Wayne A. Grudem's revised Cambridge Ph.D. dissertation *The Gift of Prophecy in 1 Corinthians* (Washington D.C.: University Press of America, 1982). M. Eugene Boring has recently added a monograph to the field called *Sayings of the Risen Jesus: Christian Prophecy in the Synoptic Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982) in which he gives a major treatment to the question of "how the post-Easter Jesus continued to speak to his church through Christian prophets." Bruce Yocum, active in the Catholic charismatic renewal, has given us a very helpful book on how the gift is generally defined, used and tested in Pentecostal and charismatic contexts in *Prophecy: Exercising the Prophetic Gifts of the Spirit in the Church Today* (Ann Arbor: Word of Life, 1976).

The gift of tongues, long overdue for major biblical and theological study, has received some treatment in recent publications. William J. Samarin has undertaken a fine linguistic study of speaking in tongues in his *Tongues of Men and Angels* (New York: Macmillan, 1972). Felicitas D. Goodman, *Speaking in Tongues: A Cross-Cultural Study of Glossolalia* (Chicago: University of Chicago, 1972), on the other hand, has looked at the subject as an anthropologist

interested in linguistics and psychology. David Christie Murray's *Voice from the Gods: Speaking in Tongues* (London: Routledge & Keagan Paul, 1978) addresses the subject phenomenologically, for the most part, and spends too much space on the phenomenon in Spiritualism. Another phenomenological study, much more helpful in its treatment of this gift in the Christian context, is Cyril G. Williams's *Tongues of the Spirit: A Study of Pentecostal Glossolalia and Related Phenomena* (Cardiff: University of Wales, 1981). Its chief drawback is its price of \$50.

Two other books deserving mention include the collection of essays from a variety of perspectives (psychological, historical, pastoral, etc.) edited by Watson E. Mills, *Speaking in Tongues, Let's Talk About It* (Waco: Word, 1973). Robert Gromacki's 1966 work, *The Modern Tongues Movement*, has been revised and is distributed by Baker. Its perspective is decidedly dispensational.

Fuller Graduate School of Psychology professor H. Newton Malony and psychology alumnus A. Adams Lovekin have co-authored a book on speaking in tongues from the perspective of the behavioral sciences which will be issued later this year as *Glossolalia: Social and Psychological Perspectives* (New York: Oxford Press, anticipated May 1985).

Other books devoted to the study of specific gifts which merit attention include Thomas C. Campbell and Gary B. Reiersen, *The Gift of Administration: Theological Bases for Ministry* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1981). Leopold Sabourin, while not dealing with the gift of miracles as such, has written an outstanding work called *The Divine Miracles Discussed and Defended* (Rome: Catholic Book Agency, 1977). Martyrdom is addressed in William Horbury and Brian McNeil, eds., *Suffering and Martyrdom in the New Testament* (Cambridge: The University Press, 1981), the article by G.W.H. Lampe, "Martyrdom and Inspiration," being exceptionally appropriate in light of the early Christian understanding of martyrdom as a gift of the Spirit.

Gifts of leadership are addressed by Martin Hengel in *The Charismatic Leader and His Followers* (New York: Crossroad, 1981) particularly as related to Jesus. Historians will find Paul Jonathan Fedwick's *The Church and the Charisma of Leadership in Basil of Caesarea* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1979) provides an equally intriguing case study. Catholic theologian Edward Schillebeeckx has written *Ministry: Leadership in the Community of Jesus Christ* (New York: Crossroad, 1981) where, among other things, he discusses celibacy as a charisma. Christian leadership in the persons of evangelists and teachers are expounded in David Watson's *I Believe in Evangelism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1976) and Joseph A. Grassi's *The Teacher in the Primitive Church and the Teacher Today* (Santa Clara: University of Santa Clara, 1973).

The all-important question of discernment of spirits has been the objective of study in Casiano Floristan and Christian Duquoc's interesting and provocative book *Discernment of the Spirit and of Spirits* (New York: Crossroad, 1979). Morton Kelsey has also addressed himself to this subject in *Discernment: A Study in Ecstasy and Evil* (New York: Paulist Press, 1978).

Several works have appeared since 1973 which address the subject of the charismatic renewal within various traditions. All of the major formal statements on the subject which have been issued by church bodies around the world since 1960 have been collected by Kilian McDonnell in his three-volume work *Presence, Power, Praise* (Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 1981).

Calvin H. Chambers has addressed himself to the subject of charismatic worship in the Reformed tradition in his book *In Spirit and in Truth* (Ardmore: Dorrance and Co., 1980). Erling Jorstad wrote *Bold in the Spirit: Lutheran Charismatic Renewal in America Today* (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1974), which has since been joined by Larry Christenson's *The Charismatic Renewal Among Lutherans* (Minneapolis: Lutheran Charismatic Renewal Services, 1976). Eusebius A. Stephanou has written on *Charismatic Renewal in the Orthodox Church* (Fort Wayne: Logos Ministry for Orthodox Renewal, 1976).

Charismatic renewal in the Roman Catholic tradition has been the subject of several authors. Following the publication of Kevin and Dorothy Ranaghan's pioneering works *Catholic Pentecostals and As the Spirit Leads Us*, published by Paulist in 1969 and 1971 respectively, were two other important works. Edward D. O Connor,

C.S.C., produced an historical and theological work called *The Pentecostal Movement in the Catholic Church* (Notre Dame: Ave Maria, 1971), and Donald L. Gelpi gave an outstanding theological critique and statement in *Pentecostalism: A Theological Viewpoint* (New York: Paulist Press, 1971). Since that time, three books of importance have been published. Kilian McDonnell has edited a work which looks at a variety of important theological questions in the movement under the title *The Holy Spirit and Power: The Catholic Charismatic Renewal* (Garden City: Doubleday, 1975). Catholic charismatic lay leader Ralph Martin has compiled *The Church and the Spirit* (New York: Paulist Press, 1976), said to provide a personal and documentary record of the renewal in the Catholic Church. French theologian Rene Laurentin has produced the third volume of importance which weaves together both history and theology, *Catholic Pentecostalism* (Garden City: Doubleday, 1977).

It must be recognized that there are differences of opinion of the value of charismatic renewal today. John F. MacArthur Jr. published a series of sermons in which he attempted to deal with what he saw as problems confronting the church as a result of charismatic renewal. It was called *The Charismatics: A Doctrinal Perspective* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1978). A much more objective analysis has been provided by Robert H. Culpepper, *Evaluating the Charismatic Movement: A Theological and Biblical Appraisal* (Valley Forge: Judson, 1977).

Four markedly irenic books on the subject have appeared which should, perhaps above all others, be congratulated for the spirit which they exude: Peter E. Gillquist, *Let's Quit Fighting about the Holy Spirit* (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 1974); Michael Harper, *Three Sisters: A Provocative Look at Evangelicals, Charismatics and Catholic Charismatics and Their Relationship to One Another* (Wheaton: Tynedale, 1979); Eric Houfe, *Vision for Unity* (Eastbourne: Kinsway Publications, 1980); and Charles E. Hummel, *Fire in the Fireplace: Contemporary Charismatic Renewal* (Downers Grove: InterVarsity, 1978). Each of these authors calls for a renewed level of Christian charity and understanding as it relates to charismatic renewal.

Several other books have appeared in recent years which look at Pentecostalism and the charismatic renewal from an ecumenical perspective. Simon Tugwell, Peter Hocken, George Every, John Orme Mills and Walter Hollenweger have collaborated on *New Heaven? New Earth? An Encounter with Pentecostalism* (Springfield, IL: Templegate, 1976). Kilian McDonnell has given us two important works. The first, *Charismatic Renewal and the Churches* (New York: Crossroad, 1976), looks both at history and psychology, using the data available in these disciplines as objects for theological reflection. His second work, *The Charismatic Renewal and Ecumenism* (New York: Paulist Press, 1978), is an attempt to further the ecumenical task providing a number of pastoral suggestions for Roman Catholics in particular.

The World Council of Churches has published two works on charismatic renewal in the past five years. Rex Davis, *Locusts and Wild Honey* (Geneva: WCC, 1978), provides an interesting survey on the subject. The second book is the outcome of a major consultation in Bossey, Switzerland, in 1980. Edited by Arnold Bittlinger, *The Church is Charismatic: The World Council of Churches and the Charismatic Renewal* (Geneva: WCC, 1981) provides a variety of papers presented at the consultation and its two preparatory sessions and makes recommendations on how WCC churches should relate to charismatic renewal.

Three theological works, all by Roman Catholics, are intended to provide some direction in the task as well. Herbert Muhlen has written *A Charismatic Theology: Initiation in the Spirit* (New York: Paulist Press, 1978), an exciting work which he describes as "the fruit of Catholic/Protestant solidarity." Charismatic Jesuit theologian Donald L. Gelpi has set forth his rigorous and rewarding *Charism and Sacrament: A Theology of Christian Conversion* (New York: Paulist Press, 1976), in which he studies conversion and gifts of the Spirit against a sacramental backdrop. His more recent work *Experiencing God: A Theology of Human Emergence* (New York: Paulist Press, 1978) provides a somewhat elaborate "foundational theology" that can be used to interpret and explain the experience of Christian worship. Gelpi's attempt is a heady one designed to encourage "critical self-understanding and theological sophistication" among those involved in charismatic renewal.

While many pastoral issues have in one way or another been addressed in a number of works already, three volumes deserve mention in their own right. Sheila Macmanus Fahey has provided a very encouraging word on social action in her *Charismatic Social Action: Reflection/Resource Manual* (New York: Paulist Press, 1977). It is a "must" for those who wish to see charismatic renewal reach out into other areas of Christian service. Charles Farah Jr., professor of theology and history at Oral Roberts University, has turned his attention to a very practical problem of "faith-formula" teaching in the book *From the Pinnacle of the Temple* (Plainfield: Logos, no date). Finally, Thomas A. Smail in *The Forgotten Father* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1980) has focused on what he perceives to be a trinitarian problem. The charismatic renewal has concentrated on the Holy Spirit and the Son whom the Spirit glorifies, but has at times overlooked the role of the Father. His book is a genuine challenge to rethink this frequent oversight.

Finally, it would be appropriate to mention a few of the many journals which regularly address issues which have been mentioned

in this article. "Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies" is the newest and perhaps the most academic of such journals. Issued semi-annually, it addresses biblical, theological, historical and practical issues related to charismatic renewal. It is edited by William W. Menzies of the faculty of the Assemblies of God Graduate School in Springfield, Missouri. "Pneuma" may be ordered by corresponding with Russell P. Spittler, a member of Fuller's faculty and secretary of the Society for Pentecostal Studies. "Paraclete," a quarterly publication dedicated to exploring the person and work of the Holy Spirit, may be ordered from Hardy W. Steinberg, editor, 1445 Boonville Ave., Springfield, Missouri 65802. From Britain comes "Theological Renewal" edited by Thomas Smail. This journal comes in a joint subscription with the more popular magazine "Renewal" and is available by writing to Grove Books, Bramcote, Nottingham, NG9 3DS, United Kingdom. A Roman Catholic periodical worthy of consideration for its practical treatment of pastoral issues is "Pastoral Renewal," P.O. Box 8617, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48107.

NEWS

Diversity Marks Wheaton Conference

by Douglas Jacobsen

For three days in March (20-22), The Institute for the Study of American Evangelicals (located at Wheaton College) hosted a rambling, yet surprisingly coherent, conference on "Christian Theology in a Post-Christian World." Thirteen presentations, each followed by a formal response and general discussion, were grouped under three major themes.

The first, entitled "Image-Maker and Images," addressed issues of connections and distinctions between the human and the divine, or, expressed more concretely, between God and human beings (presenters: J. I. Packer, Cornelius Plantinga, Stephen Evans). The second, "Revelation and Its Reception," explored different aspects of the nature and scope of human knowledge available to Christians in light of the reality of God and the limitations of human existence (Gabriel Fackre, Thomas Morris, Anthony Thiselton, Clark Pinnock). A third session—the longest of the three—dealt with more pragmatic and particular concerns (e.g., culture, work, secularization, science, the poor, and the future) and was entitled "Creation and Restoration" (Donald Bloesch, Paul Marshall Klaus Bockmuehl, David Livingstone, Richard Mouw, David Wells). John Stott presented a biblical meditation at the beginning of each of these major

sessions, and it was the expressed desire of the organizers of the conference that these homiletical talks should set the tone for and context of the discussions that followed—i.e., that of the worship of the God of the universe.

The genius of the conference was its format. It was designed as a well organized bull session. Papers were distributed in advance and were not reread at the conference. Time in meetings was spent talking, and the conversational aspect gave life to the proceedings. Another boon was that professional theologians did not dominate the landscape. Instead, evangelical thinkers from a range of academic disciplines were represented, and that too added to the creative flavor of the conversation.

The result was a pleasing overview of the state of the art of evangelical religious thinking. No broad evangelical consensus was reached by the conference. In fact, diversity was at least as prominent as agreement. But uniformity was not the aim of the gathering. Rather, the desire was to provide an initial platform from which further creative collaboration on important issues could continue. Mark Noll, one of the organizers of the conference, expressed his reaction in terms of guarded optimism: "The conference may or may not have contributed a great deal to Christian thinking on any particular subject. . . . Yet, the opportunity to observe both theologians and non-theologians talking together . . . may be a harbinger of a more refined evangelical thought for the days ahead."

Douglas Jacobsen is Assistant Professor of Church History at Messiah College, Grantham, PA.

BOOK REVIEWS

Individualism and Social Ethics: An Evangelical Syncretism

by Dennis P. Hollinger (University Press of America, 1984, 284pp., \$12.50). Reviewed by Richard V. Pierard, Fulbright Professor, Universität Frankfurt.

American Evangelicalism is now receiving the scholarly attention that it has long merited. One need only mention the books by Robert Booth Fowler, James D. Hunter, and George Marsden, the Hatch-Woodbridge-Noll collective work, *The Gospel in America*, and the formation of the Institute for the Study of American Evangelicals, all of which came about in the last five years, to provide evidence of this. Dennis Hollinger's study of Evangelical social ethics is a welcome and significant addition to the literature.

A professor at Alliance Theological Seminary, Hollinger possesses an understanding of the inner dynamics of Evangelicalism that makes his critique

all the more trenchant. He goes beyond what some of us have done in explicating the alliance with conservative politics and the lack of social concern to get at the root of these external manifestations of the flawed evangelical philosophy. His thesis is that individualism is the most basic motif of Evangelical social thinking.

He begins by defining individualism and Evangelicalism, both historically and theoretically. He then makes a content analysis of *Christianity Today*, the chief theological voice of the Evangelical movement, during the period 1956-76 in order to determine how much of an individualistic social philosophy is to be found there. The topics he explores are personal versus social ethics, social change, economic thought, and political views. He concludes with a sociological and theological analysis of the findings.

Hollinger defines individualism as: 1) a metaphysics with an atomistic world view; 2) a value system that heralds freedom, privacy, autonomy, and self-sufficiency, and most importantly 3) a social philosophy which stresses personal morality over social ethics, individual transformation as the

key to social change, the laissez-faire approach to economic matters, and a political theory extolling the freedom of the individual and a limited state. He sees modern Evangelicalism as a movement preaching historic Christian orthodoxy but without the rancor and excesses of Fundamentalism. It seeks to recapture the spirit of cooperation and openness that characterized nineteenth-century Evangelicalism, places more value upon intellectual pursuits, and emphasizes social involvement.

The book is rich in insights, of which the most helpful may be his explanation of how Evangelicalism's ineffectiveness in the social realm results from its belief that the individual, not the church, is to act; social problems are magnified personal problems; the regeneration of individuals (not reformation of institutions or revolution) is the proper strategy to achieve change; and God's standards apply to the spiritual kingdom while the realm of the world is under natural law and we can do little about things here. The unfortunate stance on economic and political questions taken by many writers in *Christianity Today*, which Hollinger copiously documents, flows naturally from this underlying